

Oak Park Historic Preservation Commission
ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW COMMITTEE
April 17, 2023 Meeting Minutes
Remote Participation Meeting, 7:30 pm

A. ROLL CALL

PRESENT: Sarah Doherty, Andrew Elders, Lou Garapolo, and Scot Mazur
ABSENT: None
STAFF: Susie Trexler, Historic Preservation Urban Planner

B. AGENDA

Motion by Elders to approve the agenda. Second by Doherty. Motion approved 4-0.

AYE: Doherty, Elders, Garapolo, and Mazur
NAY: None

C. MINUTES

Motion by Commissioner Doherty to approve the minutes from February 23, 2023. Second by Commissioner Mazur.

AYE: Doherty, Elders, Garapolo, and Mazur
NAY: None

Motion by Commissioner Doherty to approve the minutes from March 23, 2023. Second by Commissioner Elders.

AYE: Doherty, Elders, Garapolo, and Mazur
NAY: None

D. Advisory Review: 610 N East Ave (Brian & Marcella Douce): Advisory Review of proposed new garage (Frank Lloyd Wright-Prairie School of Architecture Historic District).

Chair Garapolo introduced the project. Planner Trexler provided an overview. She said demolition of the previous garage was approved by the Historic Preservation Commission on April 13, 2023.

Brian Douce, the homeowner, was present. He said they measured the eaves of the historic garage as recommended by the Commission but the east and west eaves were different. He

said he would be interested in the Committee's perspective. Chair Garapolo asked what is proposed and Mr. Douce confirmed it's one foot. Currently the side facing the alley has a little over two feet and the north and south are 12 inches. He said it's inconsistent and they are also turning the garage. Committee member Elders said it's fine since they're changing the orientation. He said he likes the roof pitch and the two different types of dormers. He asked if the windows in the house are historic and Brian said they're all new. Committee member Elders said the old garage has 6-over-1 light windows so house might originally have had 6-over-1. Mr. Douce said they originally matched the 6-over-1 but then decided to match the house. Chair Garapolo asked about saving the historic windows in the garage and Brian said they're not usable but they may save them for decorative purposes.

Committee member Elders recommended narrower windows and Chair Garapolo agreed. He said the historic garage has sills under and a drip edge at the top; it is important to have these details. They can be done in PVC and you can't tell the difference once it's painted. The Committee agreed. Committee member Doherty said keeping that detail and the fascia gives a nod to the historic design. The design looks good, it's compatible.

Chair Garapolo said he's glad to see the LP Smartside selection and he likes the way they handled the shingling above like on the house. He said he has no other concerns.

- E. **HPC2023-19: 201 N Cuyler Ave (Matthew McCormick):** Certificate of Appropriateness for front porch restoration and some alterations to address water drainage (Ridgeland-Oak Park Historic District).

Chair Garapolo introduced the project. Planner Trexler provided an overview. She recommended that the project meets the categories of restoration and limited effect, and may therefore be approved by the Architecture Review Committee.

Darrell Griest and Chris Goode, the architects, were in attendance. They called the homeowner, Matt McCormick, and put him on speaker phone so he could listen in. Mr. Goode explained the changes they think have been made to the porch, primarily in the 1960s. The columns are now flush with the 1960s window enclosure. The wing walls at the stairs are concrete block covered in stucco, likely 1960s. He said they want to go back to the original depth and solve the sagging corner. They will take out the windows and put things back, like the scuppers at the lower porch. Mr. Goode said they don't know how water originally got out of the 2nd floor porch, but it's not working. They will try to pitch it towards the sides. He said they also want to add a guard rail at the top; they don't want to raise the wall up because it will block the windows but they want to meet code for the second-floor railing. They propose a thin, metal rail painted a dark color so it disappears as much as possible.

Chair Garapolo said he's not sure the guard rail needs the vertical elements and asked if it's four inches. Mr. Griest confirmed it's four inches. Mr. McCormick said his intent is to keep the historic parts of the house as intact as possible, but they are concerned about safety and water drainage. Chair Garapolo asked if the current damage is due to water or settlement and Mr. Goode said they aren't sure but there's a downspout stick out of the column and they're not sure it's original. It looks like the backing on the current stucco is plywood from the 1950s or 60s. The column is likely the original dimension.

Committee member Elders said based on photos the stucco is over lath, which is how it would have been originally. He said they could also install some long flower boxes to mask spans of the railing. Committee member Doherty said she's seen flower boxes incorporated into railings. Mr. Goode said the problem with a flower box is if you're sitting on the porch you can't see out.

Committee member Elders said they should trim out the side scuppers like the ones on the front and paint them to match the stucco rather than the trim so they disappear. He said everything else is appropriate. He asked if they will have to build a new porch and Mr. Goode said they are hoping not.

Committee member Elders said he hopes they can keep the span of the porch without adding columns. This was a noted feature for E.E. Roberts. He said he confirmed the architect and that the original owner was "Herza" from historic newspapers. Mr. Goode said they would love to keep the span but if for whatever reason they need columns, they wanted them approved. Chair Garapolo asked about the internal materials and Mr. Griest said they haven't opened it up yet. Mr. Goode confirmed they are thinking of a 32' span of steel and the problem would be holding up the deck while pulling out the old one. Committee member Elders said if they can't do the span and want the supports more unobtrusive, they could screen the porch and add very narrow columns into the screen structure. He said the house originally had a slate roof and maybe they could just a faux slate there.

The Committee discussed the columns proposed. Committee member Elders said they are fine. He said he would set them back as far as possible. The detailing and proportions look like other Roberts precedents. Chair Garapolo agreed. Committee member Doherty said she hopes they don't have to add columns but it looks alright. Committee member Mazur agreed.

Committee member Doherty said she'd glad to see these 1960s enclosures being opened up again.

Motion by Committee member Doherty to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness for the project as proposed. Second by Committee member Mazur.

AYE: Doherty, Elders, Garapolo, and Mazur

NAY: None

F. Other Business

G. Adjourn

Motion by Mazur to adjourn. Second by Doherty. Motion approved 4-0.

AYE: Elders, Doherty, Mazur, and Garapolo

NAY: None

Meeting adjourned at 8:30PM.

Minutes prepared by Susie Trexler, Historic Preservation Urban Planner.