

Oak Park Historic Preservation Commission
ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW COMMITTEE
October 27, 2022 Meeting Minutes
Remote Participation Meeting, 7:30 pm

A. ROLL CALL

PRESENT: Andrew Elders, Lou Garapolo, and Daniel Roush
ABSENT: None
STAFF: Susie Trexler, Historic Preservation Urban Planner

B. AGENDA

Motion by Garapolo to approve the agenda. Second by Elders. Motion approved 3-0.

AYE: Elders, Garapolo, and Roush

NAY: None

C. MINUTES

Planner Trexler stated that the meeting recording has been unavailable for last month's meeting so the minutes will be brought to the next meeting for approval.

D. HPC2022-56: 509 Fair Oaks Ave (Karen & William French): Certificate of Appropriateness to replace stone foundation with concrete foundation and stone veneer (Frank Lloyd Wright-Prairie School of Architecture Historic District).

Acting Chair Roush introduced the project and Planner Trexler gave an overview.

Denny Burke, the architect, was present. Denny Burke explained that the house and coach house were seen by the Historic Preservation Commission earlier this year. The foundation walls are in poor shape. He showed photos and explained the three scenarios options out by the structural engineer. He said they would like to pour a new concrete foundation with a 2" veneer of stone. The existing stone is in poor shape and has been painted. Given the age of the house and what is seen in the Village, they assume it's limestone. It appears to have a yellowish tint like Lannon, so they are proposing a Lannon stone.

Motion by Garapolo to open for discussion; Second by Elders.

Committee member Elders asked about the rest of the project and Acting Chair Roush said it was approved by the HPC four months ago. Mr. Burke confirmed. Committee member Elders asked if the existing stone can be used and Mr. Burke said they are happy to use what they can but they're not sure how much will be salvageable. Committee member Elders said he would prefer to see the existing stone reused and Mr. Burke agreed.

Committee member Garapolo asked about the depth variation of the existing stone as compared to the proposed stone. Mr. Burke said there is a lot of variety in relief on the existing stone. He showed photos of both and said this is a concern for them. Committee member Garapolo asked if a new slab will be poured to lower the basement level and Mr. Burke confirmed. He said the existing stone piers will stay. Committee member Garapolo said they have to trust the architect that the level of relief will match and he doesn't have a problem with this. Committee member Elders agreed. He recommended that they also clad the foundation of the addition at the same time rather than using clapboard to the ground. He recommended using historic stone in front of the bump-outs if they can and Mr. Burke agreed.

Motion by Committee member Garapolo to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness as proposed. Second by Committee member Elders. Motion approved 3-0.

AYE: Elders, Garapolo, and Roush

NAY: None

E. 227 Forest Ave (Cleghorn): Discuss project to build a side bay addition (Frank Lloyd Wright-Prairie School of Architecture Historic District).

Acting Chair Roush introduced the project and Planner Trexler gave an overview. Planner Trexler said that if the ARC agrees that the project is limited effect, they may approve the Certificate of Appropriateness.

Chris Wollmuth, the architect, was present. Mr. Wollmuth said the proposed bay addition will match the existing bay and will use existing materials. In that corner, the stucco has been replaced by siding but they will be replacing with stucco. It will very much be in character with the existing home.

Motion by Garapolo to open for discussion; Second by Elders.

Committee member Garapolo asked about the roofing and Mr. Wollmuth confirmed it will be asphalt shingle to match existing. Committee member Elders said it's fine and minimally visible. They're carrying over the fascia details and angle of the roof. Acting Chair Roush agreed and said it is barely visible and is compatible and he is in favor.

Motion by Committee member Garapolo to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness as proposed. Second by Committee member Elders. Motion approved 3-0.

AYE: Elders, Garapolo, and Roush

NAY: None

- F. 307 S Harvey Ave (James Podraza):** Discuss project to demolish existing garage and build a new garage (Ridgeland-Oak Park Historic District).

Acting Chair Roush introduced the project and Planner Trexler gave an overview.

Jim Podraza, the homeowner, was present. He described some of the issues including the adjacent tree, the walls are leaning, the sills have rotted out, and there has been some shifting in the floor. He said he's adjusted the doors and this is the third door they've had. The garage is leaning over so the door does not open. They want to move the garage over from the tree. He said they are hoping to make it look as close to the existing garage as possible. They will reuse the set of windows. The service door is not secure or repairable but they are in the process of getting a 5-panel door to replace it. The light will be reused over the service door.

Committee member Garapolo asked about the glass panels on the proposed door and Mr. Podraza said that is incorrect, it will be a 5-panel door. Committee member Garapolo said the status of the existing garage should be elaborated on for the full Commission. The Hardie board with the wood-like finish hasn't been approved; they recommend a wood-like product. He asked if they have considered wood siding and Mr. Podraza said the contractor is exploring options. He said he likes wood siding but reusing the existing siding is not possible. Committee member Elders asked about the reveal existing. Mr. Podraza said he doesn't know but it's a teardrop kind of design. Committee member Elders recommended measuring the reveal. He also recommended against the wood stamped material as the smooth will look closer to wood. He asked if they will continue the narrow green fascia and Mr. Podraza confirmed. Committee member Elders asked about the soffit and Mr. Podraza said it is 14" now and they are proposing 12". He said there is a 1-foot addition on the front of the garage that he thinks was added around WWII.

Committee member Elders said he understands the structural issues and likes that they will reuse the windows and light fixture. Acting Chair Roush agreed and recommended using the three symmetrical windows on the garage as existing rather than four. He said he approves of the garage either way. He asked staff what other documentation is required. Planner Trexler said additional photos of deterioration, especially including a level to show leaning,

are often requested. A letter from a structural engineer is often recommended but not required.

- G. HPC2022-57: 127 S Scoville Ave (Rutherford):** Certificate of Appropriateness for a two-story, rear addition and window changes on the side elevations as part of a deconversion to a single-family dwelling (Ridgeland-Oak Park Historic District).

No applicant was present for the item. The Committee agreed to discuss the item and have staff provide notes to the applicant.

Committee member Elders said there is too much change on the north elevation and he doesn't like the two shortened windows on the second story. This reads too much modern farmhouse. There is no rhythm to the windows as it is, but the complete eradication of all of them is too much change. Acting Chair Roush said the square windows don't make sense on a building of this vintage. The bay window isn't appropriate. Committee member Elders said he assumes the stairs bisect the two sash windows but they could do a faux fill and make them full size but with false glazing or a panel of some sort to keep the rhythm.

Acting Chair Roush said the south elevation isn't as bad, but something seems off about the windows in the back. He said he would like to see a better submission packet with a side-by-side of existing and new. On the north side there is a stone foundation but it doesn't read that way, and there is a basement window missing.

Committee member Garapolo recommended they return to the ARC as the ARC hasn't been able to resolve anything.

H. Other Business

Planner Trexler said the November ARC falls on Thanksgiving and she suggested November 17 at 7:30PM as an alternative. She said she will reach out to confirm a quorum.

I. Adjourn

Motion by Garapolo to adjourn. Second by Elders. Motion approved 3-0.

AYE: Elders, Garapolo, and Roush

NAY: None

Meeting adjourned at 8:30PM.

Minutes prepared by Susie Trexler, Historic Preservation Urban Planner.