

**Oak Park Historic Preservation Commission**  
**July 14, 2022 – Meeting Minutes**  
**Remote Participation Meeting, 7:30 pm**

**Roll Call**

Present: Chair Noel Weidner and Commissioners Asha Andriana, Sarah Doherty, Andrew Elders, Lou Garapolo, Nicole Napper, and Daniel Roush  
Absent: Commissioner Monique Chase  
Staff: Susie Trexler, Historic Preservation Urban Planner

**Agenda Approval**

*Motion by Commissioner Garapolo to approve the agenda. Second by Commissioner Elders.  
Motion approved 7-0.*

**Non-Agenda Public Comment**

None

**Minutes**

*Motion by Commissioner Garapolo to approve the minutes for June 9, 2022. Second by Commissioner Elders. Motion approved 7-0.*

**Regular Agenda**

- A. HPC2022-33: 514 Linden Ave (Mark Sneathen):** Certificate of Appropriateness to demolish existing garage and build a 1.5-story coach house (Frank Lloyd Wright-Prairie School of Architecture Historic District).

Chair Weidner introduced the application. Planner Trexler gave an overview.

Kim Smith, the architect, and Mark Sneathen, the homeowner, were present. Mr. Sneathen said when they bought the house in 2020, the garage was in very poor condition and it has been significantly altered with out-of-character additions. He said they want to build a coach house for his wife's parents, who need additional help. Contractors have informed them that they cannot replace the garage as-is without getting rid of a very large tree. He said they would like to preserve the tree and replace the structure with something that is in-keeping with the historic district.

*Motion by Commissioner Garapolo to open for discussion. Second by Commissioner Elders.*

Commissioner Garapolo said the project looks very good and is sensitive to the house. He said it would be stronger without the quarter-round windows. Ms. Smith said these windows are not necessary. Mr. Sneathen agreed and said the 6-over-1 windows are in-keeping with the house. Commissioner Elders agreed with Commissioner Garapolo and said the garage has good proportions and is beautiful without the quarter-round windows.

Commissioner Roush said he likes the project and Commissioner Andriana said she agrees with everything presented. Commissioner Doherty said she also appreciates saving the tree. Commissioner Napper agreed. Chair Weidner said it is clear the previous owner did not maintain the garage and it is past the point of being saved. He said he agrees with Commissioner Garapolo's comments. Overall, density is good for the historic district, it makes sense.

Commissioner Elders asked about the eaves, fascia, and gable treatment. Ms. Smith said she documented the house and matched everything on the garage.

*Motion by Commissioner Elders to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness with the condition that the quarter-round windows be removed. Second by Commissioner Napper. Motion approved 7-0.*

*AYE: Commissioner Andriana, Commissioner Doherty, Commissioner Elders, Commissioner Garapolo, Commissioner Napper, Commissioner Roush, and Chair Weidner*

*NAY: None*

- B. HPC2022-34: 322 S Cuyler Ave (John Korpics & Colleen Burns):** Certificate of Appropriateness to replace the existing stoop with a covered porch at entrance on side elevation (Ridgeland-Oak Park Historic District).

Chair Weidner introduced the application. Planner Trexler gave an overview.

Kristin and Keith Jones, the architects, were present. Ms. Jones said in addition to the fact that they don't believe the existing porch is historic, the owners have had trouble with ice and inclement weather. They want a more protected entry that will also improve the entrance's appearance from the street.

*Motion by Commissioner Doherty to open for discussion. Second by Commissioner Andriana.*

Commissioner Garapolo said he doesn't have a problem with replacing the stoop. The proposal is inviting and compatible with the house. Commissioner Andriana said this is an improvement from what is there and she likes it. Commissioner Roush said it looks terrific and asked about the material of the steps and risers. Ms. Jones said they would like to use painted or stained wood to match the trim on the house. The homeowner would like to use the area underneath as storage for gardening. Mr. Jones said the access would be on the back so would not be visible. Commissioner Elders said this is an elegant solution.

Chair Weidner asked staff about the addition. Planner Trexler said it is not visible from the street. Mr. Jones confirmed it's on the rear only. Chair Weidner asked how the stoop with tie in to the house and Mr. Jones explained, noting that it will meet the trim band and the roof pitch matches the pitch of the main house. Commissioner Elders asked if there is any indicate of the height of the original roof. Mr. Jones said they only have the Sanborn map and other similar F.A. Hill & Co. houses to go from. The used an overhang similar to the house. Chair Weidner said he appreciates the examples provided and it is interesting that some of the porch roofs are flat. Mr. Jones agreed and said there are examples of with flat and hip roofed porches.

*Motion by Commissioner Roush to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness for the project as proposed. Second by Commissioner Andriana. Motion approved 7-0.*

*AYE: Commissioner Andriana, Commissioner Doherty, Commissioner Elders, Commissioner Garapolo, Commissioner Napper, Commissioner Roush, and Chair Weidner*

*NAY: None*

- C. HPC2022-35: 140 S Euclid Ave (Meredith & Dave Schacht):** Certificate of Appropriateness to alter windows and door location on the rear elevation and restore stucco siding as part of an interior renovation for house on corner lot (Ridgeland-Oak Park Historic District).

Chair Weidner introduced the application. Planner Trexler gave an overview.

Tim Eberline, the architect, was present. He said he is available for questions.

*Motion by Commissioner Garapolo to open for discussion. Second by Commissioner Elders.*

Commissioner Garapolo said the project is very complimentary to the house. He asked about the clerestory windows on the north elevation and Mr. Eberline clarified that these are on the existing front porch. Commissioner Garapolo said he is in favor. Commissioner Doherty agreed and said they are sensitive alterations. They will improve this recognizable corner home.

Commissioner Elders asked where they will get the brick and Mr. Eberline said there's a pile of bricks in the garage he hopes to use. Otherwise he's working with a mason to match brick as needed. Commissioner Elders said it looks nice. Chair Weidner said he shouldn't have a hard time finding something to match. Commissioner Roush said he was not familiar with this house but it is gorgeous and is suffering in the back. He said he is very much in favor of the modifications. Commissioner Elders said there might still be some brick imbedded in the kitchen wall. Mr. Timberline agreed.

*Motion by Commissioner Elders to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness as proposed. Second by Commissioner Doherty. Motion approved 7-0.*

*AYE: Commissioner Andriana, Commissioner Doherty, Commissioner Elders, Commissioner Garapolo, Commissioner Napper, Commissioner Roush, and Chair Weidner*

*NAY: None*

- D. HPC2022-36: 154 N Elmwood Ave (Gina Santangelo & Michael Nickels):** Certificate of Appropriateness to alter windows on the side elevations and alter the entry wall (Frank Lloyd Wright-Prairie School of Architecture Historic District).

Chair Weidner introduced the application. Planner Trexler gave an overview. She said the project was previously reviewed by the Architectural Review Committee (ARC) on June 23, 2022. The applicant applied their recommendations.

Present on behalf of the project were: Dori Betancur and Daniel Roman, the architects; and Gina Santangelo and Michael Nickels, the homeowners.

Ms. Betancur said the notes from the ARC were very helpful. She said they provided a few options for review.

*Motion by Commissioner Elders to open for discussion. Second by Commissioner Garapolo.*

Commissioner Elders said the proposal is exactly what he had in mind with his previous recommendations. If you have a window, leave a window. Otherwise, the infilled shutter option.

The Commission discussed the entry wall. Ms. Betancur said option 1 is stucco with a brick soldier course at the bottom and a painted metal railing. The stairs would be painted wood. Option 2 is a brick wall with a soldier course at the bottom and painted metal railing. The stairs would be concrete. Mr. Nickels said they prefer option 1. Commissioner Garapolo said he is in favor of option 1. Commissioners Elders and Andriana agreed. Chair Weidner agreed and asked about the landing dimensions. Mr. Nickels said currently there is no landing. Adding the landing would move the stairs about 42" towards the street.

Commissioner Elders brought up the south elevation and said with either option, there should be a center mullion in the upstairs window. Commissioner Garapolo and Chair Weidner agreed. Chair Weidner asked for an explanation of the lower window. Mr. Nickels said in option 1, the window would be infilled so it is water tight and shutters would be put over. In option 2, they would put plywood behind the window to close it from the interior. However, they may have some water intrusion. Chair Weidner asked if option 1 would retain the window frame and Mr. Nickels confirmed. Chair Weidner said the intent is reversibility. Commissioner Elders said in that case, option 1 is preferred as option 2 would lead to maintenance issues that would damage the window going forward. Commissioner Garapolo agreed.

The bathroom window mullions were discussed and the homeowners expressed a preference for one mullion over three. The Commissioners agreed one mullion would be sufficient. Commissioner Elders said it should be wider so it reads like the rail on the existing window. Ms. Betancur said they can do this.

Commissioner Doherty asked about the existing windows and Mr. Roman explained what is there currently. Commissioner Roush said he is ok with either option but likes option 1.

Commissioner Chair asked if there are no changes on the west elevation and Ms. Betancur confirmed. Commissioner Roush said the Juliette balcony is important and the fabric should stay there. Commissioner Doherty said option 1 looks good as long as the upstairs window has a division in it. Commissioner Napper said she's getting the same feeling from both options; if the homeowners prefer option 1, that is fine. Commissioner Andriana said she prefers option 1.

*Motion by Commissioner Elders to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness with the condition that option 1 be used in both cases and a strong central mullion be added to the second-floor bathroom window. Second by Commissioner Andriana. Motion approved 7-0.*

*AYE: Commissioner Andriana, Commissioner Doherty, Commissioner Elders, Commissioner Garapolo, Commissioner Napper, Commissioner Roush, and Chair Weidner*

*NAY: None*

- E. HPC2022-23: 318 S Humphrey Ave (Bryan & Michelle Scheffers):** Certificate of Appropriateness to replace a window on the side elevation with a smaller, vinyl window (Ridgeland-Oak Park Historic District).

Chair Weidner introduced the application. Planner Trexler gave an overview. She said the project was previously approved by the HPC on May 12, 2022, with the condition that the new window be clad wood. The homeowner requested vinyl based on cost, but the Commission felt insufficient

information was provided and they requested cost estimates. She noted that the existing window is from 2008.

Michelle and Bryan Scheffers, the homeowners, were present. Ms. Scheffers said they are available for any questions.

*Motion by Commissioner Roush to open for discussion. Second by Commissioner Garapolo.*

Commissioner Elders said he was not opposed to the vinyl in May, due to the window being so far back. Commissioner Garapolo asked about the proportion of vinyl to wood windows currently. Mr. Scheffers said maybe a quarter of the windows are vinyl. Ms. Scheffers said they canceled their vinyl window order and were hoping it would be a minimal cost to do clad wood, but it isn't.

Chair Weidner said he appreciates the cost breakdown. Commissioner Doherty said she didn't recall from last time that the current window is from 2008. Commissioner Andriana said the only issue last time was providing the price.

Commissioner Roush said he doesn't think they should be approving vinyl windows, he is reluctant on principle. Mr. Scheffers said there are about nine houses on the block that have front-facing vinyl windows. Commissioner Elders asked staff to recap requirements for window replacement. Planner Trexler said homeowners may replace windows with vinyl through an administrative Advisory Review process if the window will not change in size. Commissioner Elders said their hands are tied unless the review process is changed.

Chair Weidner said wood will last longer and the value might be there. The vinyl window will fail in 20 or so years, but they probably have wood windows that are 100 years old.

*Motion by Commissioner Elders to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness as proposed, allowing the vinyl window. Second by Commissioner Napper. Motion approved 5-2.*

*AYE: Commissioner Andriana, Commissioner Doherty, Commissioner Elders, Commissioner Napper, and Chair Weidner*

*NAY: Commissioner Garapolo and Commissioner Roush*

## **OTHER BUSINESS**

None.

## **ADJOURN**

*Motion by Commissioner Napper to adjourn; Second by Commissioner Garapolo. Motion approved 7-0.*

*AYE: Commissioner Andriana, Commissioner Doherty, Commissioner Elders, Commissioner Garapolo, Commissioner Napper, Commissioner Roush, and Chair Weidner*

*NAY: None*

The meeting adjourned at 8:45PM.

Minutes prepared by Susie Trexler, Historic Preservation Urban Planner.