

**Oak Park Historic Preservation Commission
June 9, 2022 – Meeting Minutes
Remote Participation Meeting, 7:30 pm**

Roll Call

Present: Chair Noel Weidner and Commissioners Asha Andriana, Monique Chase, Sarah Doherty, Andrew Elders, Lou Garapolo, and Daniel Roush
Absent: Commissioner Nicole Napper
Staff: Susie Trexler, Historic Preservation Urban Planner

Agenda Approval

*Motion by Commissioner Elders to approve the agenda. Second by Commissioner Garapolo.
Motion approved 7-0.*

Non-Agenda Public Comment

None

Minutes

Motion by Commissioner Elders to approve the minutes for May 12, 2022. Second by Commissioner Roush. Motion approved 7-0.

Regular Agenda

- A. HPC2022-28: 716 N Kenilworth Ave (Jane Flanagan and Brian Phelan):** Certificate of Appropriateness to add a rear addition and alter windows on the side elevation as part of an interior renovation (Frank Lloyd Wright-Prairie School of Architecture Historic District).

Chair Weidner introduced the application. Planner Trexler gave an overview.

Debra McQueen, the architect, was present. She described the project and said the roof on the north side will be extended, filling in the corner of the second-floor roof. It will barely be visible as it has a low pitch. There is an overhang of about three feet that will be maintained.

Motion by Commissioner Elders to open for discussion. Second by Commissioner Garapolo.

Commissioner Elders said the project looks appropriate and thoughtful. Commissioner Garapolo said the changes meet the Guidelines and he is in favor. Commissioner Chase said she likes how the single window looks vs. the bank of three and approves of the changes. Commissioner Doherty said she likes the project and it is sensitive to the home. Commissioner Roush agreed.

Commissioner Elders asked if the rear portion was a sleeping porch and Ms. McQueen said it appears so as there are bands of windows on all three sides.

Commissioner Garapolo asked if the new windows will match existing and Ms. McQueen confirmed. She said they will be Marvin 6-over-1 light, double-hung-sash windows. The new windows at the back will go down to the trim.

Chair Weidner asked about the type of stucco and recommended they make sure it's replicated accurately. Ms. McQueen said it's a meringue stucco and they use a good stucco company that can match the existing texture.

Motion by Commissioner Elders to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness as proposed. Second by Commissioner Garapolo. Motion approved 7-0.

AYE: Commissioner Andriana, Commissioner Chase, Commissioner Doherty, Commissioner Elders, Commissioner Garapolo, Commissioner Roush, and Chair Weidner

NAY: None

- B. Advisory Review: 509 Fair Oaks Ave (Karen and William French):** Advisory Review for proposed new coach house (Frank Lloyd Wright-Prairie School of Architecture Historic District).

Chair Weidner introduced the application. Planner Trexler gave an overview.

Denny Burke, on behalf of Tom Bassett-Dilley Architects, was present. Mr. Burke said the windows will be the same company as the new windows on the main house. The detailing will be similar, but the finish will be different. They will match the siding exposure of the house but will use LP Smartside siding on the coach house.

Commissioner Elders said he would like to see the windows and doors framed out more expressively to fit better with the house. This would soften the contrast between the two. Commissioner Garapolo agreed. Mr. Burke agreed and said using white around the windows like the house would also help. Commissioner Elders said he likes windows on the second floor facing the house, it looks like an old sleeping porch.

Commissioner Roush said he likes this project and it looks acceptably contextual with the house. He said he appreciates the Modernist move. He asked staff to explain why this is Advisory Review. Planner Trexler said the existing garage has been dramatically altered and no longer retains historic integrity. Commissioner Roush asked about the similar project on Forest Ave and Planner Trexler said she would follow up with him.

Commissioner Roush said the design is handled elegantly and threads the needle between historic and modern. Chair Weidner agreed and said it gives a nod to the house while being contemporary. He asked if there will be gutters and Mr. Burke said there will, they just didn't make it on the drawings.

Commissioner Andriana said she agrees with the previous Commissioners. Commissioner Chase agreed and said the coach house will be largely hidden from the street.

- C. HPC2022-29: 509 Fair Oaks Ave (Karen and William French):** Certificate of Appropriateness to demolish chimney and alter window locations on the side elevations as part of a larger renovation project (Frank Lloyd Wright-Prairie School of Architecture Historic District).

Chair Weidner introduced the application. Planner Trexler gave an overview. She explained the project and that the Commission's review consists of the demolition of the chimney and the window alterations on the side elevations with the exception of those behind the bay on the south and behind the wing on the north.

Denny Burke, on behalf of Tom Bassett-Dilley Architects, was present. Mr. Burke said their goal is to build a new house inside a historic shell. They are replacing all windows and the historic decorative sashes will be reinstalled with a new window on the outside, essentially as a storm window. They will also be replacing the siding and trim in order to add a weather barrier. The goal is to salvage the siding and trim, starting on the front and working back. Where needed, new cedar will be used to match.

Motion by Commissioner Elders to open for discussion. Second by Commissioner Roush.

Commissioner Garapolo said the overall removal and replacement of the siding is quite an endeavor and he applauds that. He said he doesn't have any problem with the window changes or the chimney removal. He said from the current rendering, the coach house roof slope is very different from the house and asked if this view is accurate. Mr. Burke said the neighbor's house is fairly close. You will see a glimpse of the coach house. The house roof is 12/12 and the coach house is about 7/12. The goal was getting as steep as possible while staying under the 20-foot height limit. Commissioner Garapolo said it's going to be difficult to see, so this is a minor comment.

Commissioner Elders said he doesn't have a lot of faith that the siding will be salvageable. Mr. Burke said the benefit is that the front has fairly small runs of cedar, approximately 4-6-foot lengths. The hope is that given the long lengths on the south and south, they can at minimum have enough to do the front elevation. Then they will feather back.

Chair Weidner asked for an explanation of why the siding is being removed. Mr. Burke said they are insulating the interior to such a degree that they feared any moisture going through the siding would condense and not have a way out. So, they are adding a weather barrier and a breather to allow water to make its way out. Commissioner Elders asked if this will change the dimensions and how the corners are treated. Mr. Burke said it will change a half inch in total. There are no corner boards, but the siding will not go back in the exact locations, it will be recut.

Commissioner Chase said the purview of the Commission is the chimney and windows. She asked if the bricks from the chimney can be reused. Mr. Burke said they would be happy to find a location for them, possibly the rear patio or on-grade room. Chair Weidner said the Commission has seen similar chimney requests numerous times. Commissioner Doherty asked for the reason and Mr. Burke said energy efficiency and removing this hole in the building envelope.

Chair Weidner asked if the head height, sills, and trim will remain the same on the windows and Mr. Burke confirmed. Chair Weidner asked about the transom window near the rear and Mr. Burke said he believes that was a porch that was enclosed. Commissioner Roush said the proposed windows look better than what was there. Commissioner Andriana agreed and said they are more balanced.

Chair Weidner asked why the solar panels are not part of the review. Planner Trexler said they do not require Commission review if they are on the side elevation, only on the front. Commissioner Roush asked why the siding is not part of the review and Planner Trexler said as it will be repaired to match, it is not considered demolition but restoration. If it were to be altered, it would be part of the COA.

Motion by Commissioner Doherty to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness as proposed. Second by Commissioner Andriana. Motion approved 7-0.

AYE: Commissioner Andriana, Commissioner Chase, Commissioner Doherty, Commissioner Elders, Commissioner Garapolo, Commissioner Roush, and Chair Weidner

NAY: None

OTHER BUSINESS

In reference to the previous discussion regarding when coach houses require a Certificate of Appropriateness, Planner Trexler said the previous property on Forest Ave was an Oak Park Landmark. This means a Certificate of Appropriateness is required for any work, not limited to demolition of historic materials. For the historic districts, a Certificate of Appropriateness is only needed when there is demolition of historic materials.

Commissioner Garapolo asked if the Commission can get a brief summary that clarifies the review process. Planner Trexler said she will provide one.

ADJOURN

Motion by Commissioner Garapolo to adjourn; Second by Commissioner Elders. Motion approved 7-0.

AYE: Commissioner Andriana, Commissioner Chase, Commissioner Doherty, Commissioner Elders, Commissioner Garapolo, Commissioner Roush, and Chair Weidner

NAY: None

The meeting adjourned at 8:20PM.

Minutes prepared by Susie Trexler, Historic Preservation Urban Planner.