Oak Park Historic Preservation Commission ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW COMMITTEE

January 27, 2022 Meeting Minutes Remote Participation Meeting, 7:30 pm

A. ROLL CALL

PRESENT: Lou Garapolo, Rachel Will, and Noel Weidner

ABSENT: None

STAFF: Susie Trexler, Historic Preservation Urban Planner

B. AGENDA

Motion by Garapolo to approve the agenda. Second by Will. Motion approved 3-0.

AYE: Garapolo, Will, and Weidner

NAY: None

C. MINUTES

Motion by Will to approve minutes of the November 18, 2021. Second by Garapolo. Motion approved 3-0.

AYE: Garapolo, Will, and Weidner

NAY: None

D. 614 S Elmwood Ave (Will Gillespe): Advisory Review for the construction of a new garage (Gunderson Historic District).

Chair Weidner agreed to proceed with the item without the applicant present. Staff to provide written review to the applicant.

Chair Weidner introduced the project and Planner Trexler gave an overview.

Committee member Garapolo said wood or LP Smartside siding is preferred and he is not in favor of vinyl. He said it is not clear what the window and door details would be, but these should be compatible with the house details.

Dave Krecek, the project contractor, arrived at 7:36PM.

Chair Weidner updated Mr. Krecek on the discussion and said they'd like more information on the windows. Mr. Krecek said the color will match the house and the window will be a typical vinyl, single-hung window.

Chair Weidner said the hip roof is appropriate as it mimics the house. Typically, the Committee asks that more details from the house be incorporated, like the deep eaves. Mr. Krecek said due to the proximity of the lot line, that is prohibited. Committee member Will said the door and window are off-the-shelf, so it's not looking to the house at all for design. Mr. Krecek explained the selections made and said the new building codes adopted January 2 have changed the lot line requirements, especially concerning eaves.

Committee member Garapolo said the Committee looks for window, window trim, door, and door trim that are reflective of the house. He said he understands the setback commentary but the applicant should consider the details and siding type. Mr. Krecek said he will talk to the homeowner regarding a Smartside product.

E. 116 S Harvey Ave (Dan George): Advisory Review for the construction of a new garage (Ridgeland-Oak Park Historic District).

Chair Weidner introduced the project and Planner Trexler gave an overview.

Dave Krecek, the project contactor, and Dan George, the homeowner, were present. Mr. Krecek said there is a powerline issue here; the powerlines have to be moved to accommodate a taller garage. Chair Weidner asked about the height difference and Mr. Krecek said the garage will have a 6/12 pitch gabled roof, approximately 14'8" and the applicant is spending additional funds to have these lines relocated. The existing garage is close to 12'.

Committee member Garapolo said his comments are the same as the previous project. Wood or LP Smartside siding are recommended over vinyl. The trim around the windows and doors, as well as the types of windows and doors, should be similar to the house. Mr. Krecek said all of his garages have 4" trim to provide a finished look. Some of these properties have 3" wood trim and he would love to use a 3" vinyl to match, but they have currently stopped making this due to supply chain issues and production capabilities.

Committee member Will asked what is driving the height. Mr. Krecek said the homeowner didn't want a cookie-cutter garage, they wanted something that looked a little nicer. There has also been an increased demand in roof clearance for more storage space. Committee member Will asked if, by cookie-cutter, he means the surrounding garages. Mr. Krecek said a lot of old garages were built with taller rooflines and some aren't. Some municipalities require a minimum of a 6/12 slope for historic districts. Mr. George, the homeowner, said

there is a variety on the block and they felt the gable and pitch matched the house better. Chair Weidner said he noticed and appreciated that. Mr. George said he will review the comments and see what they can take into account. Chair Weidner said the original wood siding on the house has a shorter reveal, so if you can pick that up on the garage that would be nice, even if you have to use LP Smartside. Mr. Krecek said this will be taken into consideration.

F. 215 Randolph St (Richard King and Marcie Gililland): Certificate of Appropriateness to alter a pair of kitchen windows on the side elevation (Ridgeland-Oak Park Historic District).

Chair Weidner introduced the project and Planner Trexler gave an overview.

John Barney, the general contractor, was present. He said they will use stucco to match the wall and will match the casing.

Motion by Committee member Garapolo to open for discussion; Second by Committee member Will.

Committee member Garapolo said he doesn't have any issues. He asked about the "option 2" mentioned in the packet and Mr. Barney said this is a holdover. The client originally requested a bay but this was discouraged. Committee member Garapolo said the proposal looks appropriate. Committee member Will said they will be replacing the non-historic windows to be more in-keeping with the other windows on the house.

Chair Weidner clarified the location and that it is a meringue stucco. Mr. Barney confirmed that it is and they will be able to mimic it. He said they have worked with this stucco company before and it has been successful. Chair Weidner said he doesn't have any concerns.

Motion by Committee member Garapolo to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness application as proposed. Second by Committee member Will. Motion approved 3-0.

AYE: Garapolo, Will, and Weidner

NAY: None

G. 719 N Oak Park Ave (Allison and Luke Siebeneck): Discuss project to restore original full-width front porch (Frank Lloyd Wright-Prairie School of Architecture Historic District).

Chair Weidner introduced the project and Planner Trexler gave an overview.

Rosanne McGrath, the architect, as well as Allison and Luke Siebeneck, the homeowners, were present. Ms. McGrath walked the Committee through the project, including the history of the house and the alterations. She said the original wrap-around porch was still there as late as 1950 but the house has been extensively changed since then. There is evidence the house was originally clapboard, but as the Sanborn map indicates stucco, they believe it was stucco on the top half and clapboard on the bottom. A photo of a similar house, 626 N Kenilworth Ave, was provided. Ms. McGrath said with the exception of the front, all details are very simple. The house was probably originally more like an American Foursquare. The pediment and brackets are likely not original as they would have overlapped with the original porch roof. Ms. McGrath explained the design decisions made for the new porch.

Committee member Garapolo said he appreciates the amount of research and likes what was presented as the "preferred" front elevation. He asked if the pediment will be left and Ms. McGrath said they will put in a flat, beadboard ceiling and remove the pediment. Committee member Garapolo asked what is below the window at the far left of the front elevation and Ms. McGrath said it is wood paneling that is currently there. Committee member Garapolo said he would support this proposal.

Committee member Will agreed with Committee member Garapolo. She said she agrees this is not original detailing. It's probably 1970s Classical Revival. She asked what is significant and Planner Trexler said the period of significance for the district ends in 1941, so the 1950 Sanborn map was a key discovery to show what would be considered historic. Committee member Will said she is in favor of the project.

Chair Weidner said he agrees it was likely a Foursquare and said a historic photo would be nice. Ms. McGrath said the earliest photo they found was from 1960 and it already looked like this, so it wasn't helpful. Chair Weidner asked about the top dormer and if there were changes to that too as Foursquares usually have squared off dormers. Ms. McGrath said she doesn't know. Chair Weidner recommended that more photos be provided of the trim from the rest of the house. He said he likes the "preferred" option and asked if the porch roof meets the front of the house. Ms. McGrath confirmed and said the elevation is also showing the bay behind the porch. Chair Weidner recommended considering the connection between the front bay and the porch roof. Ms. McGrath said they are proposing to not change the trim and just extend it down to meet the roof. Chair Weidner said it looks appropriate.

Committee member Garapolo said if they have information on the remaining historic house trim, that would be helpful. Otherwise the project looks good. Committee member Will said to make sure the railing details are defined, including the size of balusters, rails, and spacing. She recommended photos of where the pilaster details came from.

H. Other Business

None

I. Adjourn

Motion by Will to adjourn. Second by Garapolo. Motion approved 3-0.

AYE: Garapolo, Will, and Weidner

NAY: None

Meeting adjourned at 8:30PM.

Minutes prepared by Susie Trexler, Historic Preservation Urban Planner.