Oak Park Historic Preservation Commission November 11, 2021 – Meeting Minutes Remote Participation Meeting, 7:30 pm

Roll Call

Present: Chair Noel Weidner and Commissioners Asha Andriana, Sarah Doherty, Andrew Elders,

Lou Garapolo, and Rebecca Houze

Absent: Commissioners Monique Chase, Nicole Napper, and Rachel Will

Staff: Susie Trexler, Historic Preservation Urban Planner

Chair Weidner welcomed Commissioner Elders and said they will do introductions at the end of the meeting.

Agenda Approval

Motion by Commissioner Houze to approve the agenda. Second by Commissioner Garapolo. Motion approved 6-0.

Non-Agenda Public Comment

None

Minutes

Motion by Commissioner Doherty to approve the minutes for October 14, 2021. Second by Commissioner Garapolo. Motion approved 6-0.

Regular Agenda

A. 205 S East Ave (Andrew Lane): Advisory Review for the construction of a new garage (Ridgeland-Oak Park Historic District).

Chair Weidner introduced the application. Planner Trexler gave an overview. She explained that the previous garage was not historic and was not visible from the street. The new garage will be visible, so Advisory Review is required.

Andrew Lane, the homeowner, was present.

Commissioner Garapolo asked what type of siding is proposed and Mr. Lane said it will be vinyl and confirmed that the house is stucco. Mr. Lane said the previous garage was a mismatch of siding, so this is an upgrade. Commissioner Garapolo said the Commission generally recommends wood siding or LP Smartside over vinyl. He said the house has nice, broad, overhanging eaves and recommended having similarly deep eaves on the garage. Mr. Lane said the house has overhangs that are four feet or so, but these are 28 feet in the air. If you were to match that on a 10-foot garage, the scale wouldn't work. Commissioner Garapolo agreed and said the recommendation would be more the visual impression of a generous overhang. He said the design overall looks fine. Mr. Lane said it may be possible on the dormer that faces the street. He explained that it wouldn't be possible on the lowest part without raising the wall but the garage has to stay under 20 feet.

Chair Weidner agreed with Commissioner Garapolo and recommended that a non-vinyl siding be used, preferably LP Smartside or wood. Mr. Lane said wood isn't the greatest from a waterproofing perspective but if there's a better product out there, he is open to looking at it.

Commissioner Doherty agreed with the previous recommendations and recommended extending the eave on the dormer, particularly as that is the part that will be visible, especially in the winter. Commissioner Houze agreed and asked if a hip roof was considered. Mr. Lane said it was; the gable roof was selected as it provides the best interior space. He said he had hail damage to the house roof and it was more expensive to repair due to the hips. Commissioner Houze recommended that the garage match more of the character of the house in terms of material and massing.

B. HPC2021-50: 600 Gunderson Ave (Etienne Pelaprat): Certificate of Appropriateness to add two double-hung sash windows on the side elevation (Gunderson Historic District).

Chair Weidner introduced the application. Planner Trexler gave an overview and explained that the COA only covers the windows on the south elevation as the rear of the house is not historic.

Etienne Pelaprat, the homeowner, was present.

Motion by Commissioner Garapolo to open for discussion; Second by Commissioner Houze.

Commissioner Garpaolo asked if the new windows will match the other windows on the house. Mr. Pelaprat said they will, including the same manufacturer and wood type. Commissioner Elders said the floor plan notes a fixed pane but this appears to have been changed. Mr. Pelaprat confirmed and said they changed the windows to better meet the Guidelines.

Chair Weider said it is nice to see they're aligned with the other windows. Commissioner Houze agreed and asked if they will match the dimension of other windows in width. Mr. Pelaprat said they will each be three feet wide and there is another three-foot-wide window in the staircase up to the second floor. Commissioner Houze asked what this interior location was previously and Mr. Pelaprat said it's a living room. Commissioner Houze said she doesn't have any problem with the plan.

Commissioner Andriana said she likes the plan and doesn't have any other comments or concerns. Commissioners Doherty and Garapolo agreed. Chair Weidner asked about the material and Mr. Pelaprat said it will be aluminum-clad wood.

Motion by Commissioner Houze to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness for the project to add the two windows on the south elevation as proposed. Second by Commissioner Elders. Motion approved 6-0.

AYE: Commissioner Andriana, Commissioner Doherty, Commissioner Elders, Commissioner Garapolo, Commissioner Houze, and Chair Weidner

NAY: None

C. HPC2021-52: 232 S Euclid Ave (Linda and John Hillman): Certificate of Appropriateness to replace front porch flooring, stair treads, and stair risers with a synthetic material (Ridgeland-Oak Park Historic District).

Chair Weidner introduced the application. Planner Trexler gave an overview.

John Hillman, the homeowner, was present. He said one main reason they're contemplating this material is to avoid the constant repair of the current painted wood flooring.

Motion by Commissioner Garapolo to open for discussion; Second by Commissioner Houze.

Commissioner Garapolo asked about the proposed color and Mr. Hillman said it's called "mahogany" and is almost identical to the existing color. Commissioner Garapolo asked about the box or planter at the lower right of the stairs. Mr. Hillman said it is just a platform. The designer of the staircase put it in, it doesn't serve any major function. Commissioner Garapolo asked if it would be the same material as the stairs. Mr. Hillman said it would and that it is an extension of the third stair. Commissioner Garapolo said the technical specs show that the product is not completely solid at the ends and asked how the stairs will be finished. Mr. Hillman said just the treads will be changed and the risers will remain wood. He said there is another product that is smooth all the way around and that is used to create boarders. That will give the appearance of being solid through.

Commissioner Houze said her question has been answered, which had to do with the risers. She said if they are wood, she doesn't have any problems. Mr. Hillman said the risers will be wood and will require paint. They will match the existing color scheme.

Commissioner Andriana said she has no questions and that she likes the proposal. Commission Doherty said it is appropriate. She said the box has the important function of symmetry for the stairs.

Motion by Commissioner Andriana to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness for project replace the porch flooring and stair treads as proposed. Second by Commissioner Garapolo. Motion approved 6-0.

AYE: Commissioner Andriana, Commissioner Doherty, Commissioner Elders, Commissioner Garapolo, Commissioner Houze, and Chair Weidner

NAY: None

OTHER BUSINESS

- APA-IL Plan Commissioner Training.

Planner Trexler said APA-IL is offering a virtual training on November 17 and Commissioners should let her know by Monday if they are interested in attending.

- Historic Preservation Awards

Commissioner Doherty represented the HPC at the awards panel on October 23 and gave a summary to the Commission. She noted the members of the panel and said she was able to offer local historical context. Planner Trexler said the awards will be virtual this year and should occur in mid-December. She said she would update the Commission.

- Commission Introductions

The Commission welcome new Commissioner, Andrew Elders.

ADJOURN

Motion by Commissioner Garapolo to adjourn; Second by Commissioner Doherty. Motion approved 6-0.

AYE: Commissioner Andriana, Commissioner Doherty, Commissioner Elders, Commissioner Garapolo, Commissioner Houze, and Chair Weidner

NAY: None

The meeting adjourned at 8:15PM.

Minutes prepared by Susie Trexler, Historic Preservation Urban Planner.