Oak Park Historic Preservation Commission ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW COMMITTEE

July 22, 2021 Meeting Minutes
Remote Participation Meeting, 7:30 pm

A. ROLL CALL

PRESENT: Lou Garapolo, Rachel Will, and Noel Weidner

ABSENT: None

STAFF: Susie Trexler, Historic Preservation Urban Planner

B. AGENDA

Motion by Garapolo to approve the agenda. Second by Will. Motion approved 3-0.

AYE: Garapolo, Will, and Weidner

NAY: None

C. MINUTES

Motion by Will to approve minutes of the July 1, 2021. Second by Garapolo. Motion approved 3-0.

AYE: Garapolo, Will, and Weidner

NAY: None

D. 309 Linden (Timothy McCarthy): Advisory Review to place solar panels on the front elevation of the house (Frank Lloyd Wright-Prairie School of Architecture Historic District).

Chair Weidner introduced the item and Planner Trexler gave a summary.

Timothy McCarthy, the homeowner, and Jack Johannesson, of Windfree Solar, were present. Mr. McCarthy described the project. He said the north side is shaded and does not get sunlight, there is a chimney on the south, which is why there are not panels in that location. He explained his interest in solar and said we should encourage street-facing solar so people see it. He said he loves the historic qualities of the house and this will not distract from that. We should be promoting the use of solar as one way we can combat climate change.

The location and type of solar panels was discussed. In response to questions from Chair Weidner, Mr. Johannesson confirmed that the racking will only be used for the flat roof portion, which need to be angled. The proposed panels will be black with black frames.

Committee member Garapolo said he appreciates and applauds the movement towards solar panels and agrees with everything except that the solar panels would enhance the front elevation. He said it is clear based on the photo that the roof is visible from the street and the solar panels will look like hatches on the roof. That is not in keeping with the historic nature of the roof. Mr. McCarthy said they looked into removing those panels, but they are east-facing so removal would subtract a large amount of solar gain. He said we need to be doing everything we can to encourage solar.

Committee member Will asked if the house will be 100% solar powered and Mr. McCarthy said it will be close. Mr. Johannesson said the goal for the project was getting as many panels as possible. Committee member Garapolo said four out of 43 panels can't make a huge difference and they detract from the front of the house.

Chair Weider said reusing old buildings is a sustainable practice. Sustainability needs to be balanced with preservation. This house exists because people like the way it looks and panels on the front detract from that. He said the aesthetics, the way it has looked for 100 years, have contributed to its longevity. The Commission always asks that the solar panels just not be placed on the main elevation.

Committee member Will asked about the reversibility of the installation without damaging the existing building and Mr. Johannesson said removal is relatively easy and pretty commonplace in the industry currently. He said it's essentially comparable to doing reroofing work.

E. 202 S Harvey (Tristan Kiel): Advisory Review for new garage, existing garage not historic (Ridgeland-Oak Park Historic District).

Chair Weidner introduced the item and Planner Trexler gave a summary.

Tristan Kiel, the homeowner, was present. He said they just moved in and the existing garage is past its serviceable life and doesn't meet his family's needs. He said some of the changes they've made will match the home better, including the siding profile, 12" eaves, matching windows, and matching colors.

Committee member Garapolo said he has no problem with the siding or windows. He asked about the appearance of the existing garage. Mr. Kiel said the door currently facades the street and they will reorient the garage off the alley and add a setback from the north.

Chair Weidner asked it there was a reason against having a window on the side facing Pleasant St and Mr. Kiel said just security purposes. Chair Weidner said it looks stark as a blank wall and a window would add some character. Mr. Kiel said they will take this into consideration. Committee member Garapolo agreed and said a window instead of a blank wall would be more in character with the house and he didn't think it would make a big difference in terms of security. Chair Weidner said having two windows on the east elevation would work well.

Committee member Will asked about the site plan of the new garage in comparison to the old garage and Mr. Kiel explained the differences. He said it will be moved over to meet setback from the street side. The fence was discussed. Chair Weidner asked about the roof pitch and Mr. Kiel said it will be a gable for more storage. He said it has a less severe peak than the house due to the large tree and powerlines.

Chair Weidner agreed with Commissioner Garapolo that the siding was an appropriate choice.

F. HPC2021-39: 219 S Cuyler Ave (Ashley Kawuki): Certificate of Appropriateness to demolish the chimney and raise the side bay roof height 3'3" to accommodate attic stair remodel (Ridgeland-Oak Park Historic District).

Chair Weidner introduced the item and Planner Trexler gave a summary.

Errol Kirsch, the architect, was present. He addressed the previously-reviewed screened porch proposal and said the homeowners have decided to restore the existing windows. He said for the bay, he has no objection to keeping the window location but would have to add tempered glass and an interior rail for safety as it would be close to the floor. He said they will use the same siding, fascia, and roof pitch, and the roofing will be replaced to match. The addition on the rear will have new roofing as well. He said the homeowners are going to a high-efficiency, two-part system, so the chimney is not necessary and they could use the space it occupies on the second level.

Motion by Committee member Garapolo to open for discussion. Second by Committee member Will.

Committee member Garapolo said he is glad to hear the front windows will be restored. He asked if the windows on the first floor will remain unchanged and Mr. Kirsch confirmed. Committee member Garapolo said he doesn't have a problem with moving the window up. He said it looks better and will be less awkward from the interior. Committee member Will agreed with Committee member Garapolo's comments and said she is pleased to hear the

windows will be restored. Chair Weidner asked about the new portion of wall where the roof will meet the dormer. This detail was discussed. Chair Weidner agreed that the window move is appropriate and said he has no issue with the chimney.

Motion by Committee member Will to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness application as proposed. Second by Committee member Garapolo. Motion approved 3-0.

AYE: Garapolo, Will, and Weidner

NAY: None

G. HPC2021-34: 1115 Home Ave (Bryan Gilsenan and Nolliag Duffy): Certificate of Appropriateness to add a second-story rear addition over an existing one-story portion of the house, in line with the existing second story (Gunderson Architecture Historic District).

Chair Weidner introduced the item and Planner Trexler gave a summary.

Drew Nelson, the architect, was present. He described the project and said there is an existing one-story addition that lines up with the house and they will be building off of that. He said the windows are smaller because they are located in bathrooms but there will be a double-hung window in the bedroom.

Motion by Committee member Garapolo to open for discussion. Second by Committee member Will.

Committee member Garapolo said the addition is minimally visible and the details match the house. The divider trim board is appropriate. He said he doesn't have any issues. Committee member Will agreed and said the proposal respects the historic character of the house. She asked about differentiation at the roofline. Mr. Nelson said he typically steps in the roof 6" but since there is an existing first story, they lined up the second story with that. Committee member Will asked if it will be reroofed so it is continuous and Mr. Nelson confirmed and said they will match the shingles and you won't be able to tell the difference.

Chair Weidner brought up the pediment-like feature on the current rear elevation and asked it this will be replicated. Mr. Nelson said it will. Chair Weidner said he agrees with the other Committee members and has no issues. He said he appreciates that the deep eaves will be retained, as this is another main feature of this house.

Motion by Committee member Garapolo to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness application as proposed. Second by Committee member Will. Motion approved 3-0.

AYE: Garapolo, Will, and Weidner

NAY: None

H. HPC2021-36: 716 Woodbine Ave (Luke Vassiliades): Certificate of Appropriateness for a rear addition in line with the existing house (Frank Lloyd Wright-Prairie School of Architecture Historic District).

Chair Weidner introduced the item and Planner Trexler gave a summary.

Pat McGill, of RWC Commercial, and Luke Vassilaides, the homeowner, were present. Mr. McGill said the addition will be similar to other additions in the area, including the neighbor to the north. He said the house currently has vinyl siding but the homeowner may change this in the future.

Committee member Garapolo asked what is driving the small windows on the south elevation. Mr. McGill said on the second floor they will be above the bed. They matched the windows on the first floor to the second. Committee member Garapolo asked if there is any layout that would allow the new windows to be double-hung to match the rest of the house. Mr. McGill said they might be able to place them on either side of the bed, but they would have to be lower than the existing windows to accommodate the soffit and fascia line. Committee member Will said there is an existing small double-hung window in the attic that could be used as a reference for smaller double-hung windows.

The Committee discussed the north and south elevations. Mr. McGill said there is some room on the side of the house on the south side but not the north. There is a three-foot rule in order to put in windows, and the rear of the house is 2'11" from the lot line.

Committee member Will asked about the roofing material and Mr. McGill confirmed that the roofing will all be redone to match.

Chair Weidner agreed with Committee member Garapolo's comments on the windows. He said the scale is appropriate and the addition is lined up with the house and at the rear of the lot. He said the wall on the north is unfortunate and he is glad to hear the siding material could be restored to clapboard in the future.

Committee member Will asked if any of the historic siding still exists and Mr. McGill said he doesn't know yet. Committee member Will said this is something to consider from a documentation standpoint. Document existing conditions so restoring the siding is not conjecture.

APPROVED 8/26/21

Motion by Committee member Will to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness application as proposed with the consideration of using double-hung sash windows on the south façade. Second by Committee member Garapolo. Motion approved 3-0.

AYE: Garapolo, Will, and Weidner

NAY: None

Mr. McGill asked for clarification on next steps and the Committee agreed that elevations should be sent to staff.

I. Other Business

None

J. Adjourn

Motion by Garapolo to adjourn. Second by Will. Motion approved 3-0.

AYE: Garapolo, Will, and Weidner

NAY: None

Meeting adjourned at 8:30PM.

Minutes prepared by Susie Trexler, Historic Preservation Urban Planner.

6