

Oak Park Historic Preservation Commission
April 8, 2021 –Meeting Minutes
Remote Participation Meeting, 7:30 pm

Roll Call

Present: Chair Noel Weidner and Commissioners Sandra Carr, Monique Chase, Sarah Doherty, Lou Garapolo, and Rebecca Houze
Absent: Commissioners David Sokol and Rachel Will
Staff: Susie Trexler, Historic Preservation Urban Planner
Attorney: Greg Smith, Klein, Thorpe & Jenkins

Agenda Approval

Motion by Commissioner Garapolo to approve the agenda. Second by Commissioner Doherty. Motion approved 6-0.

Non-Agenda Public Comment

None

Minutes

Motion by Commissioner Garapolo to approve the minutes for March 11, 2021. Second by Commissioner Houze. Motion approved 6-0.

Regular Agenda

- A. HPC2021-18: 217 S Elmwood Ave (Katie Hogan):** Certificate of Appropriateness to install internal chimney and alter windows on the side elevations (Ridgeland-Oak Park Historic District).

Chair Weidner introduced the application. Planner Trexler gave an overview.

Katie Hogan, the homeowner, was present on behalf of the project. She said she was previously unaware she was in a historic district, but was able to alter the chimney design and is pleased with the outcome. She described the proposed project to the Commission.

Motion by Commissioner Garapolo to open for discussion; Second by Commissioner Houze.

Commissioner Garapolo said the new windows should match existing, but as they will be reused, this is no longer an issue. He expressed concern that the homeowner was unaware they were in a historic district.

Commissioner Carr said the internal chimney is a good solution. The chimney materials were discussed. Ms. Hogan said the existing chimney has a concrete-block-like material. They are proposing a brick veneer for the new chimney. She confirmed that this will be applied to a wood frame. Commissioner Houze said she does not have a problem with the chimney as it won't be very obtrusive. She asked Ms. Hogan to describe the proposed window changes. Ms. Hogan described the proposal, noting that all three windows from the bay will be reused, one on the side and two on

the rear of the building. The window changes are being done to accommodate moving the kitchen. The current windows in this location are very low to the ground.

Ms. Hogan confirmed for Chair Weidner that the infill will be wood clapboard.

The Commission discussed the egress window. Commissioner Carr said the egress window looks appropriate as long as it matches the historic windows. Chair Weidner, Commissioner Houze, and Commissioner Garapolo agreed.

Commissioner Houze said in the past, when original windows are taken from a character-defining feature, the Commission has asked that some trace of the window be left. Commissioner Carr gave the example of keeping the wood trim and infilling with clapboard. She said this has been previously done both for windows that have been raised and windows that have been removed. Chair Weidner agreed and said this has been requested to maintain a consistency of sill and header heights.

Motion by Commissioner Houze to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness for the project as proposed with the condition that the window trim be retained on windows that will be removed or altered in size. Second by Commissioner Garapolo. Motion approved 6-0.

AYE: Commissioner Carr, Commissioner Chase, Commissioner Doherty, Commissioner Garapolo, Commissioner Houze, and Chair Weidner

NAY: None

- B. HPC2021-19: 1127 Home Ave (Kelly Daley and Tim Bittner):** Certificate of Appropriateness for renovation including a rear addition, side dormer additions, two door replacements, and the relocation of windows on the side elevations (Gunderson Historic District).

Chair Weidner introduced the application. Planner Trexler gave an overview.

Chester Chlebek, the architect, and Kelly Daley, the homeowner, were present. Mr. Chlebek described the project and said they will be putting the new siding over the existing siding.

Motion by Commissioner Doherty to open for discussion; Second by Commissioner Houze.

Commissioner Garapolo asked for confirmation on the new siding type and Mr. Chlebek said it will be LP Smartside. Commissioner Garapolo asked if the dormers meet the Guidelines size requirement and Mr. Chlebek confirmed they do. Commissioner Garapolo asked about the windows and Mr. Chlebek said they will match exactly what is existing, including the pattern on the porch windows.

Commissioner Houze said the dormers seem large. She said she was looking for similar dormers in the Gunderson Historic District and did not find any. Mr. Chlebek said the new dormer is not over-scaled, it matches the existing bay on the first floor and is extended up. Commissioner Carr said she does not think they are out of scale, but it's hard to get a real idea by looking at the front elevation. She said they will appear smaller, especially as a lot of the surface area will be shingles, and she doesn't think they are as large as they appear from the front elevation drawing. Mr. Chlebek and Commissioner Garapolo agreed. Chair Weidner said they are also near the back of the existing house. Commissioner Houze said that answers her question.

Chair Weidner asked for clarification of what will happen with the diamond patterned windows. Mr. Chlebek said they are existing and will be replaced to match exactly. Commissioner Carr requested

shop drawings and said that in the past, staff has reviewed these. Mr. Chlebek said they can ask the manufacturer for shop drawings. Chair Weidner said the Commission's motion should include staff review of the shop drawings for the diamond pane and porch windows.

Commissioner Doherty said overall the project is being sensitive to the historic district but it is changing the character of the house. Commissioner Houze agreed but said she is compelled by the architects on the Commission that the dormers will be in keeping with the proportions of the house. Commissioner Carr recommended keeping the eave line across the north dormer to further help with the scale feeling. Mr. Chlebek said they can do this. Chair Weidner thanked Commissioner Carr for the suggestion.

Commissioner Houze asked about the window material and Mr. Chlebek said they will be aluminum-clad wood. The Commission agreed that the vertical trim piece should be used to differentiate the existing house from the addition.

Chair Weidner asked about the existing siding and the Ms. Daley said it is asbestos from the 1960s/1970s. She confirmed the new siding will go on top of the existing asbestos siding. Chair Weidner asked about the shingles proposed on the front gable end. Ms. Daley said they chose this because there is a house down the street with extant historic siding and it has shingles on the gable end. Chair Weidner asked about the trim and Mr. Chlebek said the proposed LP siding material requires corner trim.

Motion by Commissioner Garapolo to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness for the project as proposed with the conditions that the roofline be carried through the north dormer and that shop drawings of the decorative windows be provided to staff for final approval. Second by Commissioner Carr. Motion approved 6-0.

AYE: Commissioner Carr, Commissioner Chase, Commissioner Doherty, Commissioner Garapolo, Commissioner Houze, and Chair Weidner

NAY: None

- C. HPC2021-20: 512 Fair Oaks Ave (Zdenek Krcmar):** Certificate of Appropriateness for two-story, rear addition (Frank Lloyd Wright-Prairie School of Architecture Historic District).

Chair Weidner introduced the application. Planner Trexler gave an overview. She said the applicant attended the Architectural Review Committee (ARC) meeting on March 25, 2021. The ARC recommended that the dormers could be continued back but that the addition be differentiated with a piece of vertical trim. The ARC requested a 3D image or rendering showing the back corner to clarify how the rear roofline will be handled. The applicant has incorporated these recommendations.

Zdenek Krcmar, the homeowner, introduced himself and said the architect of the project is also present.

Motion by Commissioner Doherty to open for discussion; Second by Commissioner Garapolo.

Chair Weidner asked why the gambrel roof won't be pulled out on the rear. Mr. Krcmar said the house is not wide enough. He said he originally wanted to do a side addition, but because of the historic district, the addition will go straight back. The gambrel roof removes space from the interior. Commissioner Carr said the design makes more sense with the photos of the back of the building.

The dormer is being brought down. This would be visible from the street; it will look like the gambrel is continuing all the way back. Commissioner Garapolo agreed.

Commissioner Houze asked Planner Trexler if the secondary gambrel on the rear is original. Planner Trexler said due to the size and as there is no record of an addition, it is likely original. Commissioner Carr clarified that it is not in the purview of the Commission as it is not visible and Planner Trexler confirmed. Chair Weidner said the Commission can, however, ask the homeowner to consider recommendations regarding the rear.

Chair Weidner asked about the materials and Mr. Krcmar confirmed they will use wood shingle siding to match existing. The windows will be vinyl with LP Smartside trim.

Chair Weidner noted that the existing windows on the house are not the same in the existing vs. proposed elevations. The Commission discussed the windows. Mr. Krcmar said the existing windows on the house are all vinyl and he wants to replace them with a more appropriate glass pattern. At the request of the Commission, Mr. Krcmar said he will match all the windows on the addition to the windows on the house.

The Commission agreed that the use of a vertical piece of trim to differentiate new from old is appropriate in this case.

Motion by Commissioner Carr to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness for project with the condition that the window pattern used on the addition must match the windows on the house. Second by Commissioner Garapolo. Motion approved 6-0.

AYE: Commissioner Carr, Commissioner Chase, Commissioner Doherty, Commissioner Garapolo, Commissioner Houze, and Chair Weidner

NAY: None

- D. HPC2021-21: 512 Fair Oaks Ave (Zdenek Krcmar):** Certificate of Appropriateness to demolish the existing garage and build a new garage (Frank Lloyd Wright-Prairie School of Architecture Historic District).

Chair Weidner introduced the application. Planner Trexler gave an overview.

Zdenek Krcmar, the homeowner, was present. He described the state of the current garage, noting that it is leaning, the doors are not original, and the roof and sides are rotted. He said he is trying to build a new garage that is similar to the existing garage. He is proposing LP Smartside siding with a 3" profile.

Motion by Commissioner Garapolo to open for discussion; Second by Commissioner Houze.

Commissioner Garapolo said the existing garage proportions are nice. He asked if the new garage roof will match. Mr. Krcmar confirmed that the new roof will match the existing garage roof. Commissioner Garapolo said he agrees demolition is the best route.

Commissioner Doherty asked if the existing garage windows are original and if they are operable. Mr. Krcmar said they have rotted and do not open. He said no one has been fixing anything on the property for years and he is doing major foundation repair in the house. Chair Weidner asked if the house was previously abandoned and Mr. Krcmar said it was not. Commissioner Garapolo said

typically windows of this type were top-hinged. Commissioner Houze said she likes to see the old windows on these garages and if they were salvageable, that would be nice. She said she does not have any problem with the design for the new garage. They are recreating a very simple garage built in 1925. Commissioner Garapolo agreed and said he likes the use of the LP Smartside siding. Commissioner Carr said she appreciates the inclusion of the trim at the garage door. The care to the details around the windows is nice. Chair Weidner agreed and asked if the overhang matches that on the existing garage. Mr. Krcmar said they matched the historic eave. He said they tried to match the historic garage as much as possible.

Motion by Commissioner Garapolo to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness for the project as proposed. Second by Commissioner Houze. Motion approved 6-0.

AYE: Commissioner Carr, Commissioner Chase, Commissioner Doherty, Commissioner Garapolo, Commissioner Houze, and Chair Weidner

NAY: None

OTHER BUSINESS

- None

ADJOURN

Motion by Commissioner Garapolo to adjourn; Second by Commissioner Houze. Motion approved 6-0.

AYE: Commissioner Carr, Commissioner Chase, Commissioner Doherty, Commissioner Garapolo, Commissioner Houze, and Chair Weidner

NAY: None

The meeting adjourned at 9:00PM.

Minutes prepared by Susie Trexler, Historic Preservation Urban Planner.