## Oak Park Historic Preservation Commission ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW COMMITTEE

# March 25, 2021 Meeting Minutes Remote Participation Meeting, 7:00 pm

#### A. ROLL CALL

PRESENT: Noel Weidner, Sandra Carr, and Lou Garapolo

ABSENT: Rachel Will

STAFF: Susie Trexler, Historic Preservation Urban Planner

#### B. AGENDA

Motion by Garapolo to approve the agenda. Second by Carr. Motion approved 3-0.

AYE: Garapolo, Carr, and Weidner

NAY: None

### C. MINUTES

Motion by Garapolo to approve minutes of the February 25, 2021. Second by Carr. Motion approved 3-0.

AYE: Garapolo, Carr, and Weidner

NAY: None

**D. HPC2021-16: 810 Belleforte Ave (Gopal Balakrishnan and Phobey Cass):** Final review of conditional COA approval to demolish the existing garage and build a new garage (Frank Lloyd Wright-Prairie School of Architecture Historic District).

Chair Weidner introduced the project. Planner Trexler gave a summary. She said the Historic Preservation Commission approved the Certificate of Appropriateness on March 11, 2021, with the condition that the deck be moved to the rear of the garage, where not visible from the street, and that the Architectural Review Committee provide final review and approval. Closely spaced balusters, in keeping with the historic district, were recommended, but will not be visible from the street.

Kim Smith, the architect, was present on behalf of the project.

Motion by Committee member Garapolo to open for discussion; Second by Committee member Carr.

Committee member Garapolo thanked the applicant for taking the HPC's comments. He asked about the siding material. Ms. Smith said the applicant looked into LP Smartside but has decided to use Hardie board. The Committee recommended wood clapboard or a wood product like LP Smartside. Chair Weidner said this is a recommendation only and the conditions made by the HPC have been met. Ms. Smith said the homeowner did research siding alternatives.

Committee member Carr made a motion to provide final approval the Certificate of Appropriateness for the project as proposed. Second by Committee member Garapolo. Approved 3-0.

AYE: Garapolo, Carr, and Weidner

NAY: None

**E. 815 N Elmwood Ave (Neil Benchell):** Advisory Review of proposed new garage (existing garage not historic and not visible from the street) (Frank Lloyd Wright-Prairie School of Architecture Historic District).

Chair Weidner introduced the project. Planner Trexler gave a summary.

Brent Showalter, the contractor, was present. He described the project and said the homeowner has collectable cars, so the garage was designed to accommodate those.

Motion by Committee member Garapolo to open for discussion; Second by Committee member Carr.

Committee member Garapolo asked why the central section is taller. Mr. Showalter said there will be two car lifts in this portion. The owner has Model T's and this contains the lifts to restore those. Committee member Garapolo said this is very large for a single-family garage and he is not in favor of the size.

Committee member Carr said the siding will go with the stucco on the house. She asked about the roof slope and Mr. Showalter said it is comparable to the house roof slope. Committee member Carr said she likes the hip roof because the house has a hip roof and asked why there are no windows on the alley side. Mr. Showalter said the homeowners don't want windows on the alley because there is a lot of theft in the area. He said the Model T's are taller than current cars and won't fit in the current garage. This is why there

are 8-foot garage doors in the center. He said the gable roof on one side is also to accommodate the size of the cars.

Chair Weidner said he understands the accommodations for the cars but the Committee needs to look at how the proposed garage will fit in with the historic district and the precedents that will be set. He said the garage is out of scale and he does not approve of the material, but he understands trying to replicate the stucco. He said the roof should either be hip or gable; a hip roof would make more sense to match the house. The Committee members agreed that it should be smaller. Committee member Carr said one of the sides looks more like a stable or carriage house but form is following function in this case. Mr. Showalter said there will be trim details on the columns mimicking the crosses seen on a lot of stucco columns in Oak Park.

Chair Weidner said the house is Prairie style and it has deep eaves. He recommended considering deeper eaves on the garage. Committee member Carr asked about the trim material and Mr. Showalter said the trim and banding will be wood. Committee member Carr said that is helpful. Committee member Garapolo asked if the project meets zoning requirements and Mr. Showalter confirmed that it does.

**F. 512 Fair Oaks Ave (Zdenek Krcmar):** Discuss proposed rear story addition (Frank Lloyd Wright-Prairie School of Architecture Historic District).

Chair Weidner introduced the project. Planner Trexler gave a summary. She said the homeowner is requesting feedback regarding differentiation of the addition and whether the shed roof dormers can be carried straight back or whether the existing dormers and new addition dormers should be separated.

Zdenek Krcmar, the homeowner, appeared to be present via phone but did not have audio. Chair Weidner agreed to move forward and discuss the project.

Committee member Garapolo said the new addition should be differentiated with some type of trim. He said he doesn't have a problem with the proposal. Committee member Carr said you can't see the gambrel roof from the rear because the dormers go all the way back. She said this may not matter since it's the rear. The proportions and materials look good. Having the gambrel roof at the rear would be cleaner. She said should would like to see a model because it is hard to understand the handling of the rear from a flat elevation. Committee member Garapolo agreed a rendering would be helpful.

The Committee agreed that the dormers do not have to be separated but that a vertical trim piece should be used to differentiate the addition.

**G. HPC2021-17: 181 N Grove Ave (GP Grove LLC):** Certificate of Appropriateness to restore historic concrete elements at roofline with GFRC (Frank Lloyd Wright-Prairie School of Architecture Historic District).

Chair Weidner introduced the project. Planner Trexler gave a summary. She recommended that the Commission discuss the material but that the Architectural Review Committee may approve the Certificate of Appropriateness if they find the work to qualify as restoration.

Jan Glowacki, the contractor, and John Fodor, the engineer, were present on behalf of the project. Mr. Fodor said the original material is cast stone. They are proposing a lighter GFRC material.

Motion by Committee member Garapolo to open for discussion; Second by Committee member Carr.

Committee member Garapolo said he does not have a problem with the GFRC. He asked about the approach to matching the color. Mr. Fodor directed the Committee to photos of the existing materials and samples of the new materials. He said the original is a little darker because it is dirty, but the sample matches the existing stone nicely in texture and color. Committee member Carr agreed that the aggregate looks appropriate. Mr. Fodor said the owner is particular about matching the original.

Committee member Carr said as it is cast stone already, it makes sense to use GFRC, especially given the intricateness of the details. GFRC will be the best way to get a close match and will be more secure. She said she believes this qualifies as restoration.

Chair Weidner said that Committee member Will could not attend this evening but she reviewed the proposal and prepared a statement. He asked staff to read the statement. Planner Trexler read Committee member Will's comments: "I have reviewed the materials for 181 North Grove and generally agree with the recommendations for replacement and GFRC is an appropriate replacement material for this location. They have provided the condition assessment and the existing conditions and significance of deterioration justify replacement. Additionally, this can be a safety concern as well based on the existing conditions. I would be willing to vote for replacement, as long we ensure that they are replicating the existing ornament to the best extent possible."

Chair Weidner said it looks like there are a few places where there aren't fragments. Mr. Fodor confirmed and said they will replicate the originals to the best of their ability in those cases. They took dimensions in the field.

Committee member Carr made a motion to provide final approval the Certificate of Appropriateness for the project as proposed. Second by Committee member Garapolo. Approved 3-0.

AYE: Garapolo, Carr, and Weidner

NAY: None

### H. Other Business

None

#### I. Adjourn

Motion by Garapolo to adjourn. Second by Carr. Motion approved 3-0.

AYE: Garapolo, Carr, and Weidner

NAY: None

Meeting adjourned at 7:35PM.

Minutes prepared by Susie Trexler, Historic Preservation Urban Planner.