Oak Park Historic Preservation Commission ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW COMMITTEE

February 25, 2021 Meeting Minutes Remote Participation Meeting, 7:00 pm

A. ROLL CALL

PRESENT: Noel Weidner, Lou Garapolo, and Rachel Will

ABSENT: Sandra Carr

STAFF: Susie Trexler, Historic Preservation Urban Planner

Rachel Will was introduced as a new member to the Architectural Review Committee.

B. AGENDA

Motion by Garapolo to approve the agenda. Second by Will. Motion approved 3-0.

AYE: Garapolo, Will, and Weidner

NAY: None

C. MINUTES

Motion by Garapolo to approve minutes of the January 28, 2021. Second by Will. Motion approved 3-0.

AYE: Garapolo, Will, and Weidner

NAY: None

D. HPC2021-7: 605 N Kenilworth Ave (Jed and Sara Enlow): Certificate of Appropriateness to enlarge an attic window on the side elevation to provide egress (Frank Lloyd Wright-Prairie School of Architecture Historic District).

Chair Weidner introduced the project. Planner Trexler gave a summary.

Steve Ryniewicz, the architect, was present. He described the project and said there is already some variation in the windows on the side elevation and the project will be minimal.

Committee member Garapolo said he agrees about the window pattern on the side elevation and does not think nine inches is a problem. He asked about the material of the

new window. Mr. Ryniewicz said it will be a French casement to keep it as small as possible and visually maintain what is already there. It will be aluminum-clad wood. He said they will match the trim and maintain the width of the existing opening. The casing and sill will match existing. Committee member Garapolo asked about the other existing windows and Mr. Ryniewicz said the other windows have aluminum storm windows but the attic currently does not. There is currently a louver window in this location, so this will be an improvement. Committee member Will asked about the color and Mr. Ryniewicz said it will be green with a black screen.

Chair Weidner clarified that it will basically have a mullion because it is two windows. Mr. Ryniewicz confirmed. Chair Weidner said all the attic windows are the same height so this one will not match. He asked why this window was selected. Mr. Ryniewicz said the attic stairs are near the rear of the house, so for safety reasons they did not want the egress to be right next to the stairs.

Committee member Garapolo made a motion to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness for the project as proposed. Second by Committee member Will. Approved 3-0.

AYE: Garapolo, Will, and Weidner

NAY: None

E. HPC2021-8: 327 Home Ave (G COLLINS GLA PRP MGT): Certificate of Appropriateness to enlarge basement window and create window well on the side elevation to provide egress (Ridgeland-Oak Park Historic District).

Chair Weidner introduced the project. Planner Trexler gave a summary. She said the Architectural Review Committee previously approved a windows alteration at this location on January 22, 2020, but the applicant has changed the design to include a window well rather than extend to the side.

John Schiess, the architect, was present. He explained the project and said this is the least-invasive option to address the need for egress. He said they are proposing a simulated divided light, but staff has recommended a true divided light and they are willing to consider that. The window will be wood and the historic windows are wood.

Committee member Garapolo said a true-divided light would be his preference. He asked about protection around the window well. Mr. Schiess said a railing is not required by code due to the proposed depth. Committee member Will said she likes keeping the window the same width and the depth probably won't be noticeable. She asked if a true-divided light works for egress. Mr. Schiess confirmed and said the window will still function as a full pane

as it will have muntins rather than mullions. Chair Weidner said he has no issue and prefers this to the previous plan. He said the true-divided light makes sense.

Committee member Garapolo made a motion to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness for the project as proposed. Second by Committee member Will. Approved 3-0.

AYE: Garapolo, Will, and Weidner

NAY: None

F. HPC2020-9: 112 Wesley Ave (Thompson Dawson): Certificate of Appropriateness for rear deck addition (Ridgeland-Oak Park Historic District).

Chair Weidner introduced the project. Planner Trexler gave a summary.

Chris Wollmuth, the architect, was present. He explained the project and said it will go to side because the lot is very wide. The deck will be 30 inches above grade, so no railing is required; this was done to minimize visibility. There will be cedar planters and composite decking. He said you might see some of the stairs from the street but they will be 60-70 feet back from the front lot line.

Chair Weidner asked about the front-facing wall and Mr. Wollmuth said it will be an extension of the planter box wall with stained cedar siding. Committee member Garapolo said he likes this solution. The Committee discussed the transition from wood to the stone foundation and the interface. Mr. Wollmuth said his inclination would be to set it back an inch or an inch and a half to get a bit of reveal and not mar the stone. Committee members Will and Garapolo agreed that this is appropriate. Chair Weidner said the project will be minimally visible and he has no issues.

Committee member Will made a motion to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness for the project as proposed. Second by Committee member Garapolo. Approved 3-0.

AYE: Garapolo, Will, and Weidner

NAY: None

G. 528 N Grove Ave (Lauren and Ted Bach): Discuss project to demolish garage and build a new garage (Frank Lloyd Wright-Prairie School of Architecture Historic District).

Chair Weidner introduced the project. Planner Trexler gave a summary.

Ted Bach, the homeowner, was present. He said the existing garage does not match the house and is not functional in its current form. He said the current structure is a one-car garage and they are proposing a two-car garage.

Committee member Garapolo said the Commission will want an analysis of the current garage, concluding that it is in poor shape. Planner Trexler said that some late items were submitted by architect Bob Bell addressing this. Committee member Garapolo said these are appropriate. Mr. Bach explained some of the issues.

Committee member Garapolo said the new garage is sympathetic to the house and he does not have a problem with it. Chair Weidner said it is interesting that the current garage has a hip roof and doesn't relate to the house. Committee member Will agreed and said it is likely a catalogue garage. She asked if the homeowner has ever used it. Mr. Bach said they have not. The door doesn't close all the way and doesn't lock. They use it as storage.

Chair Weidner said the bullseye trim is a nice detail. He said there is no alley and this would back up to another large garage. It would be minimally visible from the street. He requested that the applicant submit a photo with a level showing how far out-of-plumb the existing wall is. He said they should thoroughly demonstrate the state of the existing garage.

H. 219 S Cuyler Ave (Ashley Kawuki): Discuss project to open existing enclosed front porch (Ridgeland-Oak Park Historic District).

Chair Weidner introduced the project. Planner Trexler gave a summary.

Errol Kirsch, the architect, was present. He said the family is doing a lot of work on the house and this portion is fairly minor. He said there is no landing and whether they move the stairs to the front or keep them at the side, they would like to add a landing.

Committee member Garapolo said he prefers have the stairs on the side. Mr. Kirsch noted that the window pattern would have to be altered if the stairs came from the front. There was a discussion about how the porch would be opened. Committee member Garapolo said he does not have an issue with opening the porch if the windows are replaced with screens. He said the newel post and railing are heavy and should be lighter. Mr. Kirsch agreed. Chair Weidner asked about drainage within the porch. This was discussed.

Committee member Will said the windows appear to be from the 1920s. She said the stairs have likely been rebuilt. If the windows are replaced with screens, the house will read differently. The muntins add character. Mr. Kirsch said they can add muntins to the screen to match the historic windows and agreed they present a nice feature from the past.

The Committee agreed the stairs should be at the side but adding a landing is appropriate.

Mr. Kirsch asked the Committee's thoughts about the siding. He said it is currently a combination of stucco, wood, and 8-inch aluminum. They are doing extensive work on the rear and he wanted to know the Committee's recommendations, whether to use all aluminum siding or to use the stucco/siding combination as see on the front. Committee member Garapolo said he likes the thought of being consistent and Committee member Will agreed.

Committee member Garapolo said the items discussed should be clarified on the drawings for the Commission.

I. 403 N East Ave (Jakob Eriksson and Natasha Devroye): Discuss project to replace front columns with a synthetic material (Frank Lloyd Wright-Prairie School of Architecture Historic District).

Chair Weidner introduced the project. Planner Trexler gave a summary.

Debra McQueen, the architect, was present. She summarized the proposal and said the contractors she talked to did not see a reasonable way to put the columns back together. She described the deterioration and that the staves are coming loose from the interior ring. Using cedar would be twice as expensive as the cast stone product and they are concerned about modern cedar's durability and maintenance.

Chair Weidner said the Commission will want to see close-up photos of the damage, photos of the capital and base, shop drawings, and photos with a tape measure at the top and base to show that the new columns will be in kind. Ms. McQueen said the homeowner is waiting for a full quote with the specifics.

Committee member Will asked about the material and Ms. McQueen said it is a polymer stone, made of polymer resign with calcium carbonate filler. The surface has a very matte finish. They have a smoother option but this is closest to the painted finish existing. The Committee discussed the construction of the existing columns. Committee member Will said she is concerned a different material column will impact the historic wood pediment as it will settle differently. Ms. McQueen said anything new they put under the pediment, including new wood, will settle differently. Ms. McQueen confirmed that the proposed material can be cut and adjusted as needed.

Chair Weidner said the columns are a character-defining feature and he wants documentation of the current columns to confirm that the proposed columns will match exactly.

The Committee discussed the use of alternative materials in this case and asked about potential deterioration of the proposed material in this climate. Ms. McQueen said there are local examples in the Chicago suburbs. Committee member Will said the manufacturer should also have test data. Chair Weidner said they should also look into reclaimed old-growth lumber as an alternative.

Committee member Garapolo said he agrees with the previous comments made. He said rebuilding wood columns is costly and he is not opposed to a different product. Ms. McQueen said they will investigate further on the product and the existing columns and will bring that material to the HPC.

J. Other Business

None

K. <u>Adjourn</u>

Motion by Garapolo to adjourn. Second by Will. Motion approved 3-0.

AYE: Garapolo, Will, and Weidner

NAY: None

Meeting adjourned at 8:00PM.

Minutes prepared by Susie Trexler, Historic Preservation Urban Planner.