

**Oak Park Historic Preservation Commission  
October 15, 2020 – Meeting Minutes  
Remote Participation Meeting, 7:45 pm**

**Roll Call**

Present: Interim Chair Rebecca Houze and Commissioners Jennifer Bridge, Sandra Carr, Monique Chase, Lou Garapolo, David Sokol, and Noel Weidner  
Absent: None  
Staff: Susie Trexler, Historic Preservation Urban Planner  
Attorney: Patrick Collins, Klein, Thorpe & Jenkins

**Agenda Approval**

*Motion by Commissioner Sokol to approve the agenda. Second by Commissioner Bridge.  
Motion approved 7-0.*

**Non-Agenda Public Comment**

None

**Minutes**

*Motion by Commissioner Garapolo to approve the minutes for October 8, 2020, with the edits mentioned. Second by Commissioner Weidner. Motion approved 7-0.*

**Regular Agenda**

- A. HPC2020-35: 120 S Lombard Ave (Madeleine Milan):** Certificate of Appropriateness for a rear addition (Ridgeland-Oak Park Historic District).

Interim Chair Houze introduced the application. Planner Trexler gave an overview. Planner Trexler said the homeowner decided to use wood clapboard siding on the addition to match the historic siding on the house.

Daina Furuya, the architect, was present on behalf of the project. Mr. Furuya gave a summary of the project.

*Motion by Commissioner Sokol to open for discussion; Second by Commissioner Garapolo.*

Commissioner Garapolo approved of the siding and said he would like to see the wood trim band continue around the addition. He said it would be hard to see from the front but the additional would look better. Mr. Furuya agreed and said he would bring it up with the owner and general contractor for consideration. Commissioner Weidner clarified the foundation for the addition. Mr. Furuya said the foundation will be 10" concrete 6" above grade with frame and siding above. The existing foundation goes up 3 feet in height.

Commissioner Sokol said the addition looks appropriate and it is clearly delineated. Chair Houze asked about the pitch of the roof on the addition and whether it would match the front porch. Mr. Furuya clarified that it will match the pitch of the existing rear addition.

The Commission further discussed continuing the band around the bottom of the addition. It was agreed that this would be a recommendation only and not a requirement.

*Motion by Commissioner Bridge to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness for the project as proposed. Second by Commissioner Garapolo. Motion approved 7-0.*

*AYE: Commissioner Bridge, Commissioner Carr, Commissioner Chase, Commissioner Garapolo, Commissioner Sokol, Commissioner Weidner, and Chair Houze*

*NAY: None*

**B. HPC2020-36: 207 S Ridgeland Ave (Patti and Parke Brewer):** Certificate of Appropriateness for a new, expanded front porch (Ridgeland-Oak Park Historic District).

Interim Chair Houze introduced the application. Planner Trexler gave an overview and noted that the applicant has attended two ARC meetings, on August 4 and September 3.

Debbie Kent, the architect, and Patti and Parke Brewer, the homeowners, were present. Ms. Kent noted some of the changes made to meet the recommendations of the ARC, including the railing design and column spacing.

*Motion by Commissioner Weidner to open for discussion; Second by Commissioner Garapolo.*

Commissioner Weidner said he felt the examples provided show the wrap-around porch is appropriate for this style of house. He said the ARC discussed the materials and they should be discussed more. He said he does not have a problem with the decking. He said the design is in scale and works well with the house. Commissioner Carr said she suggested the 2" baluster spacing to ensure the railing looks more traditional. She said this suggestion was taken and she thinks it helps. Chair Houze clarified that the applicant has requested synthetic decking and railings. Ms. Kent confirmed.

Commissioner Garapolo said he does not see where in the Guidelines expanding the porch is addressed. He said extending it forward is appropriate, but based on the information provided by staff, he does not think the porch should be wrapped around. He said he also does not approve of the synthetic railing material but he does not have a problem on with the flooring. He said these are also the comments he made at the ARC.

Commissioner Bridge asked Planner Trexler if this is a historic porch. Planner Trexler said the current porch walls with siding are likely not historic and the porch originally probably had a railing with balusters. It is unknown if historic materials are extant under the existing siding. Commissioner Bridge said considering that the porch may not be historic materials, the wrap-around seems appropriate for the style and age of the house. She said that aspect is fine.

Mr. Brewer said there is plywood backing under the porch and it is clearly not original.

Chair Houze said she understands Commissioner Garapolo's reading of the Guidelines but the design is consistent with the style of architecture and the block. She does not have a problem with the

wrap-around. She said she is hesitant about the synthetic materials. She referenced the National Park Service Preservation Briefs and noted that the Commission has previously rejected synthetic material for railings but has approved it for decking. She said the National Park Service suggests if wood is not an option, that the synthetic material should be workable in a similar way to wood; for example, that it could be routed on site and painted. She expressed concern that a synthetic material might not age consistently with the wood posts.

Ms. Brewer said the house is wrapped in vinyl. Chair Houze said from a historic preservation perspective, you could remove the vinyl. Commissioner Sokol said based on precedent and authenticity, synthetic material could be used for decking, but there might be better synthetic materials that would be used for the railings. Ms. Brewer said the Azek material proposed can be routed. Chair Houze asked if we have a list of materials that have been approved. Planner Trexler said she can look into this. Commissioner Garapolo said he does not think the materials proposed are acceptable and he does not think they can be routed. Commissioner Weidner said synthetic railings are not seen elsewhere in the district. Chair Houze agreed that the district as a whole has to be considered.

Ms. Brewer said ecologically, the synthetic material is better as it does not have to be painted. She said eventually everyone will go this direction and someone has to be first. She said if it doesn't age well, they can remove it.

Commissioner Bridge agreed that the synthetic decking is fine but the synthetic material will be problematic in appearance for the railing. The Commission discussed requiring the railing to be wood in order to meet the Guidelines. Chair Houze said there are sustainability arguments for wood as well. Ms. Brewer asked if they can put the siding back instead of a railing. Commissioner Weidner said this would need a revised application.

*Motion by Commissioner Weidner to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness for the project as proposed with the condition that all elements must be wood except the decking. Second by Commissioner Sokol. Motion approved 6-1.*

*AYE: Commissioner Bridge, Commissioner Carr, Commissioner Chase, Commissioner Sokol, Commissioner Weidner, and Chair Houze*

*NAY: Commissioner Garapolo*

Ms. Brewer asked about an architectural detail on the house and requirements for replacing it. Planner Trexler said she would look into this.

**C. HPC2020-37: 227 Clinton Ave (Ryan Hearn):** Certificate of Appropriateness to demolish portion of garage overlapping two properties and build a new garage (Ridgeland-Oak Park Historic District).

Interim Chair Houze introduced the application. Planner Trexler gave an overview. Planner Trexler said additional information was found on the garage since consideration at the ARC meeting; it was built in 1917 to serve the neighboring apartment building as well as the house. These originally were on the same lot but have since been divided, and the garage goes across both lots. She said the homeowner has provided to options: demolition of the existing garage on the 227 Clinton property and construction of a new garage or building a garage addition.

Steve Ryniewicz, the architect, and Ryan Hearn, the homeowner, were present. Mr. Ryniewicz introduced the project. Mr. Hearn thanked the Commission and said they want to create some

separation from the existing condo parking area to the south. They also want a garage that will fit their cars and be safe for their kids.

*Motion by Commissioner Garapolo to open for discussion; Second by Commissioner Weidner.*

Commissioner Garapolo said the applicant responded well to the ARC's comments. He said he approves of option one, to demolish and build a new garage. He said the other solution is twice the cost and will result in something that will look strange. He said he appreciated the studies being provided in response to the ARC. Commissioner Carr agreed and said she appreciates the providing of two alternatives and reusing the brick on the front of the new garage. Commissioner Sokol said he has no problems with this.

Commissioner Weidner said he doesn't have no problems with the proposal, but he appreciates the quality of the historic garage and he hates to see it go. He said it would last a long time. Mr. Ryniewicz said he understands but the new garage will match the spirit of what is there and the historic house. Chair Houze said she likes the new design. She asked if the whole historic garage is brick or just the last bay. Mr. Ryniewicz said he believes it is all brick with vinyl over on the southern portion.

*Motion by Commissioner Carr to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness for the project to demolish the existing garage and build a new garage as proposed. Second by Commissioner Garapolo. Motion approved 7-0.*

*AYE: Commissioner Bridge, Commissioner Carr, Commissioner Chase, Commissioner Garapolo, Commissioner Sokol, Commissioner Weidner, and Chair Houze*

*NAY: None*

**D. HPC2020-38: 726 N Grove Ave (Johne and Allison Chapman):** Certificate of Appropriateness for rear addition (Frank Lloyd Wright-Prairie School of Architecture Historic District).

Interim Chair Houze introduced the application. Planner Trexler gave an overview. Planner Trexler clarified that the project is a renovation with multiple elements aside from the rear addition including restoring the historic full-width front porch and demolishing the chimney.

Johne Chapman, the homeowner, was present on behalf of the project. He gave a summary of the project, including what they know about the history of the changes such as the removal of the original porch and the asphalt siding.

*Motion by Commissioner Sokol to open for discussion; Second by Commissioner Garapolo.*

Commissioner Weidner asked if the item can be approved with the shortened description. Planner Trexler confirmed that the full project should just be included as part of the motion. It was agreed that the addition will not be visible and the Commission had no additional comments.

Commissioner Garapolo applauded the effort to restore the original porch and communicate with the neighbors to match their similar porch. The Commission discussed the number of columns on the porch and it was noted that the neighboring houses have three while this project proposes five. Mr. Chapman agreed to use three columns. Commissioner Carr said it should also have a hip roof rather than a shed roof as this is more typical. Mr. Chapman agreed to make this change and said he would prefer this. It was confirmed that all porch elements will be wood.

Chair Houze asked Planner Trexler to explain the procedure for the siding. Planner Trexler said the homeowner has at this point agreed to retain historic siding and install synthetic siding over; they are permitted to install the proposed synthetic siding as long as no historic siding is demolished. Commissioner Weidner recommended using cedar siding to match historic. Commissioner Garapolo agreed. Commissioner Sokol said this is not within their purview as long as there is no siding demolition.

*Motion by Commissioner Sokol to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness for the project as proposed with the condition that the porch have a hip roof and three columns. Second by Commissioner Garapolo. Motion approved 7-0.*

*AYE: Commissioner Bridge, Commissioner Carr, Commissioner Chase, Commissioner Garapolo, Commissioner Sokol, Commissioner Weidner, and Chair Houze*

*NAY: None*

**E. Advisory Review: 261 Washington Blvd (Dennis Marani):** Advisory Review of proposed new building on a vacant lot in the Ridgeland-Oak Park Historic District.

Interim Chair Houze introduced the application. Planner Trexler gave an overview. She said the applicant attended the Architectural Review Committee meeting on November 20, 2019.

Tim Pomaville was in attendance on behalf of the applicant. He presented the plans to the Commission and noted some of the changes made after attending the ARC meeting, including additional brick and a varied roofline. He said they have a lot of bump-outs to keep the building interesting and hanging balconies.

The Commission discussed the number of parking spaces. It was confirmed that the Village requirement for parking spaces is one-to-one. Commissioner Garapolo said he is pleased to see the changes track with what the ARC discussed. He said the additional brick on the verticals is effective, the roofline variation is an improvement, and the glass at the base has been added and is helpful. He said the rendering is helpful to understand the proposal and he thinks it looks good.

Commissioner Weidner said the large apartment buildings in this area feature belt courses, which he was going to recommend, but there are three horizontal bands on the proposed building. He recommended more visual interest and said the buildings in this area have more ornamentation, especially around the entrances. One way to accomplish this might be using a brick format other than utility, maybe a horizontal format or a textured brick. He said he appreciates the changes made.

Commissioner Sokol asked if there will be access to the roof and Mr. Pomaville said there will not.

Chair Houze said she appreciates that the scale is similar to that of the apartment building that was previously there. She said she likes the variation in the roofline and the use of brick. She said she agrees with Commissioners Garapolo and Weidner. She said the balconies are a little out of character with the buildings in this area.

Commissioner Carr said she appreciates the glass at the ground floor. Having not just solid walls, even though it is parking, helps with the visual interest. She also said she likes the setback and

landscaping on the west, particularly as this is an access point to the middle school and athletic fields. She said this building is appropriate for this location.

**OTHER BUSINESS**

- Commissioner Sokol brought up the number of Commissioners and when new Commissioners might be appointed. He asked if there is an update. Chair Houze explained the application process. There were no updates. The Commission discussed if they have any options and expressed concern about the difficulty in obtaining a quorum with the current number of commissioners.
- Planner Trexler said the next two months the HPC meetings will occur on the second Thursday of the month. An email will be sent out shortly to confirm a quorum.

**ADJOURN**

*Motion by Commissioner Sokol to adjourn; Second by Commissioner Weidner. Motion approved 7-0.*

*AYE: Commissioner Bridge, Commissioner Carr, Commissioner Chase, Commissioner Garapolo, Commissioner Sokol, Commissioner Weidner, and Chair Houze*

*NAY: None*

The meeting adjourned at 9:30PM.

Minutes prepared by Susie Trexler, Historic Preservation Urban Planner.