

**Oak Park Historic Preservation Commission
ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW COMMITTEE
September 3, 2020 Meeting Minutes
Remote Participation Meeting, 7:30 pm**

A. ROLL CALL

PRESENT: Committee Members Sandra Carr, Lou Garapolo, and Noel Weidner
ABSENT: None
STAFF: Susie Trexler, Historic Preservation Urban Planner

B. AGENDA

Motion by Garapolo to approve the agenda. Second by Carr. Motion approved 3-0.

*AYE: Carr, Garapolo, and Weidner
NAY: None*

C. MINUTES

Motion by Garapolo to approve minutes of the August 4, 2020. Second by Carr. Motion approved 3-0.

*AYE: Carr, Garapolo, and Weidner
NAY: None*

D. HPC2020-29: 1118 Wenonah Ave (Floyd Mohler): Certificate of Appropriateness to demolish the garage and build a new garage (Gunderson Historic District).

Committee member Weidner introduced the project. Planner Trexler gave a summary of the project. She explained that this application came to the HPC but additional information was requested regarding the state of the existing garage.

Floyd Mohler, the homeowner, was present.

Committee member Garapolo asked for the cost to repair the garage. He said he understands the structural engineer's report but the Guidelines recommend repair over replacement. Mr. Mohler said the letter stated that repair would be greater than replacement. Committee member Garapolo asked for more specifics. Mr. Mohler explained the type of repairs necessary.

Committee member Carr said the structural report seems telling and jacking up a garage to tear everything out and start over would cost a lot.

Committee member Weidner said he would like to see the garage repaired. He said you can see the foundation all the way around based on the photo. Committee member Garapolo suggested it go to the full Commission. Committee member Weidner agreed. He said it is a two-block section of the historic district and there is a lot of historic character in the alley. He said he is not ready to vote to approve and they should take no action.

Mr. Mohler said he has provided the information requested. He said there are at least a half dozen vinyl-sided garages in his alley and his garage is not visible from the street. He expressed concern about timing.

Committee member Garapolo said it's just a week until the full Commission meeting and he would feel more comfortable if the full Commission weighed in on it. Mr. Mohler asked what he can do to further make his case. Committee member Weidner said he does not think it should be torn down and it should go to the Commission for a full vote.

E. 819 Forest Ave (Meg and Jake Cappel): Discuss proposal to build a second story addition (Frank Lloyd Wright-Prairie School of Architecture Historic District).

Committee member Weidner introduced the project. Planner Trexler gave a summary.

Steve Ryniewicz, the architect, was present on behalf of the project. He described his process in developing the design and said he used resources like the Chicago Bungalow Association's recommendations for additions.

Committee member Carr said she liked that the addition is set back and has a hip roof. For a second-floor addition, this design is about as good as it will get. She said she likes the proportion of the windows on the sides.

Committee member Garapolo agreed with Committee member Carr and thanked the architect for the 3D renderings. He said the new addition is near the chimney and asked if this will meet building codes. Mr. Ryniewicz said he thinks it is close to the rule and he will check. Committee member Garapolo said this could affect the proposal so should be checked before attending the Commission. He said he likes the 3D drawings and suggested that one show what the windows and trim will look like. Mr. Ryniewicz said all the windows and trim will match existing, but he can also add this to the rendering. Committee member Carr agreed that this would be helpful for the full Commission to see.

Committee member Weidner said the 3D views give you a better idea of what it will look like. On the flat views, the back roof looks like it is towering over the existing but it is not really out of scale. He said he likes the window placement and asked about the blank wall on the north elevation. Mr. Ryniewicz said there is a closet and mechanical room against that wall. Committee member Weidner checked that rooflines are matching existing and Mr. Ryniewicz confirmed.

F. 227 Clinton Ave (Ryan and Theresa Hearn): Discuss proposal to demolish portion of garage and build a new garage (Ridgeland-Oak Park Historic District).

Committee member Weidner introduced the project. Planner Trexler gave a summary of the project.

Steve Ryniewicz, the architect, and Ryan Hearn, the homeowner, were present on behalf of the project. Mr. Ryniewicz described the project. He said that he was the architect for the restoration of the house and is all for restoration but in this case supports demolition. The property has a common driveway and the garage is attached to the neighboring multi-unit garage. He said they have looked at modifying the garage but the cost estimate was \$45,000. Even in that process, one of the challenges is that there is a depth issue as well as a width issue.

Committee member Weidner asked which building the garage is original to and Planner Trexler said she would look into this. Committee member Weidner said there are not many brick garages original to Oak Park.

Committee member Garapolo said this is a difficult project. He asked if the existing garage could remain as-is and a new addition be built to accommodate the new garage requirements. Mr. Ryniewicz said they could leave this garage and build another garage next to it. He said if there wasn't a depth issue, the equation would be cleaner, but adding something deeper than the existing creates roof issues. The existing garage is already connected to two other garages. He said the end result would look clunky and there is a usability issue still within the existing garage. Mr. Hearn said there are also two large trees on the north side that could cause issues getting in and out of a new garage.

Committee member Garapolo asked if the ARC can approve this. Planner Trexler said this will have to go to the full Commission. Committee member Weidner asked what is in the north corner and if a new garage could be built there. He said reversibility is important to the Commission. Mr. Hearn said that option would eliminate most of the backyard and egress would be tight as there is an existing paver patio behind the house. The Committee further discussed this option.

Committee member Garapolo said they should explain to the Commission that they've explored these alternatives and provide costs and impacts. Committee member Carr expressed appreciation for the brick garage. Mr. Ryniewicz said it is hard to see from the street due to the placement and because it is not on an alley.

Committee member Weidner asked Planner Trexler to look for additional context information on the history of the garage and which property it is associated with.

Committee member Carr asked what would be done with the exposed wall if demolition moved forward. Mr. Ryniewicz said the clay tile should not be left exposed and will need to be clad in something, probably vinyl to match what is already there.

Committee member Weidner said if the new garage is masonry, you can get reclaimed brick to pay homage to the existing historic garage. Committee member Carr suggested just the face. Mr. Ryniewicz said they can reuse the existing brick for this.

- G. **814 Forest Ave (Amy Skaggs and Derrick Kedziora):** Discuss proposal to add two windows on the side elevation (Frank Lloyd Wright-Prairie School of Architecture Historic District).

Planner Trexler said the applicant withdrew this application.

- H. **207 S Ridgeland Ave (Brewer):** Discuss proposal to enlarge existing front porch (Ridgeland-Oak Park Historic District).

Committee member Weidner introduced the project. Planner Trexler gave a summary of the project. She said the applicant attended the previous ARC meeting on August 4th.

The architect, Debbie Kent, and the homeowners, Patti and Parke Brewer, were present. Ms. Kent said they included photos of other wrap-around porches in the neighborhood. Ms. Brewer said the house directly behind their house has a wrap-around porch and their house is extremely similar. She said she found a lot of wrap-around porches in the area. She said someone commented on making the porch deeper. She thanked the Committee for this recommendation and said they will go one foot deeper. She said they will also take the Committee's suggestion to have an open space or square balusters under the porch. She said a lot of other porches have stone piers and asked if this is recommended.

Ms. Brewer said she feels strongly about using synthetic materials. She said they have this on their back porch. She said environmentally this is the right thing to do. She asked if they can make their front walk brick. She said they have a sandstone sidewalk and want to know if there is a way they can acquire new sandstone to repair these. Planner Trexler said the front walk change can be approved administratively as it does not necessitate demolition of

historic materials. She said the Commission has been discussion sandstone options with Public Works and has determined the quarry the sandstone originally came from. It may be possible to acquire new pieces. The Village has historically had some as well but there are none currently available.

Committee member Garapolo said stone piers would enhance the design of the front porch. He said based on staff research, some of the wrap-around porches are historic and some are alterations. He said he is having trouble seeing how the wrap-around expansion relates to the Guidelines and he would not vote for this. He said he want to Village Hall and viewed the samples. He is disappointed in the material and the Commission has not approved it before. It is not appropriate for the historic district. He said he does not have a problem with synthetic decking and this has been approved previously.

Committee member Carr said she doesn't have as big a problem with the composite materials. She said her concern is the spacing of the balusters. Building code says four inches but it looks very wide. Two inches looks more historic. She said when it is just to code, it starts to look prefabricated. She said she appreciates the bigger square balusters over the half-inch ones. She said she appreciates the change to the column spacing and the additional depth is appropriate. Ms. Brewer asked for spacing specifics. Committee member Carr mentioned the green house in the photos. She recommended two or two and a half inches but suggested that they check with their neighbors to see what theirs measure.

Committee member Weider said he appreciates the research provided. He said he does not have as big of a problem with the composite as long as the spacing is done as Committee member Carr recommends. He clarified that the columns will be wood and said the composite decking is appropriate. He said the stone piers are a nice touch.

The Committee discussed whether the space is open under the porch. Committee member Weidner said both are fine and it's their preference. Committee member Garapolo said he would like to see the verticals go down.

Committee member Weidner said the proposed wrap-around is in-keeping with the style of the house, as opposed to some of the examples in the examples in photos.

I. Other Business

Planner Trexler said now that the Village is starting hearings, Commissions with hearings are receiving preference. This means that the next ARC meeting is not yet scheduled and will likely be delayed but she will provide updates.

J. Adjourn

Motion by Garapolo to adjourn. Second by Carr. Motion approved 3-0.

AYE: Carr, Garapolo, and Weidner

NAY: None

Meeting adjourned at 8:45PM.

Minutes prepared by Susie Trexler, Historic Preservation Urban Planner.