

**Oak Park Historic Preservation Commission
December 12, 2019 - Meeting Minutes
Oak Park Village Hall, Council Chambers, 7:30 pm**

Roll Call

Present: Acting Chair Rebecca Houze and Commissioners Sandra Carr, Monique Chase, Lou Garapolo, Derrick Gurski, and David Sokol
Absent: Commissioners Jennifer Bridge, Aleksandra Tadic, and Noel Weidner
Staff: Susie Trexler, Historic Preservation Urban Planner
Attorney: Brian Gorka, Klein, Thorpe & Jenkins

Agenda Approval

*Motion by Commissioner Sokol to approve the agenda. Second by Commissioner Garapolo.
Motion approved 6-0.*

Non-Agenda Public Comment

None

Minutes

Motion by Commissioner Garapolo to approve the minutes for November 14, 2019. Second by Commissioner Gurski. Motion approved 6-0.

Regular Agenda

- A. HPC2019-72: 126 S Euclid Ave (Diane Schneider):** Certificate of Appropriateness to replace wood shingle roof with asphalt shingles (Ridgeland-Oak Park Historic District).

Acting Chair Houze introduced the application. Planner Trexler gave an overview and noted that the applicant attended the previous Historic Preservation Commission meeting and has updated her application to meet the Commission's requests.

Diane Schneider, the homeowner, was present. Ms. Schneider confirmed that the Commission received the estimate to replace the roof with cedar shingles to match existing and the Commission confirmed. Ms. Schneider said there has been a slight change in cost for the asphalt replacement, as the garage and porch were originally included. She showed the Commission a new asphalt shingle option, the Landmark Pro, which is made to mimic cedar shingle and has more depth.

Motion by Commissioner Sokol to open for discussion; Second by Commissioner Garapolo.

Commissioners Sokol and Gurski agreed that the new asphalt shingle option looks better than the previous one. Commissioner Garapolo asked for clarification on the difference and Ms. Schneider explained that there is a variation in the color.

The specific color options were discussed and Commissioner Garapolo said he prefers the darker color. Ms. Schneider explained that the cedar shingles absorb water so look very dark when wet but

are much lighter when dry. Acting Chair Houze asked to see the samples and said this looks like a good solution and either the light or dark brown would be appropriate. She thanked Ms. Schneider for providing the cost estimates.

Motion by Commissioner Sokol to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness for the project as proposed. Second by Commissioner Garapolo. Motion approved 6-0.

AYE: Commissioner Carr, Commissioner Chase, Commissioner Garapolo, Commissioner Gurski, Commissioner Sokol, and Acting Chair Houze

NAY: None

- B. HPC2019-70: 1023 Chicago Ave (David Lewis and Dakisha Lewis):** Certificate of Appropriateness to replace decorative window on the front façade to match (Frank Lloyd Wright-Prairie School of Architecture Historic District).

Acting Chair Houze introduced the application. Planner Trexler gave an overview and noted that the applicant attended the previous Historic Preservation meeting and has updated his application to meet the Commission's requests.

David Lewis, the homeowner, was present. Mr. Lewis said he is available to answer questions.

Motion by Commissioner Garapolo to open for discussion; Second by Commissioner Carr.

Commissioner Garapolo said he appreciates the follow-up. He clarified that the drawing submitted depicts the proposed new window. Acting Chair Houze said she appreciates that the new window will match the historic window.

Motion by Commissioner Carr to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness for the project as proposed. Second by Commissioner Gurski. Motion approved 6-0.

AYE: Commissioner Carr, Commissioner Chase, Commissioner Garapolo, Commissioner Gurski, Commissioner Sokol, and Acting Chair Houze

NAY: None

- C. HPC2019-74: 801 Woodbine Ave (Jonathan and Catherine Young):** Certificate of Appropriateness to replace ribbon of four 3/1 double-hung sash windows with one picture window and two 3/1 double-hung sash windows (Frank Lloyd Wright-Prairie School of Architecture Historic District).

Acting Chair Houze introduced the application. Planner Trexler gave an overview.

John Vriner, the contractor, and Catherine Gaze, the homeowner, were present. Mr. Vriner said the picture window concept is to get more light in the interior. He said it is located on the side elevation but the house is on a corner lot. Mr. Vriner said if the picture window is not acceptable, they would like to replace the four windows with four windows to match but using thinner mullions between the windows.

Motion by Commissioner Sokol to open for discussion; Second by Commissioner Garapolo.

Commissioner Garapolo said the Guidelines are clear that the windows should match. He said he would like to see the cost for repair. The windows should match but smaller mullions are appropriate.

Mr. Vriner said that the arch detail over the windows will remain.

Commissioner Sokol said the replacement with four windows but narrower mullions is a good response to the desire. Commissioner Carr agreed. Commissioner Sokol said a drawing should be submitted for final approval by staff.

Acting Chair Houze asked if the smaller mullions would mean that the windows would be larger. Mr. Vriner said slightly but the difference will be negligible. Commissioner Carr said the windows will likely be 2.5 inches larger but by replacing with a four-window unit, you aren't adding additional material between the windows.

Motion by Commissioner Carr to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness for the project which the condition that the windows are replaced with four matching windows, as proposed, with narrower mullions, and that a drawing of the proposed windows should be submitted to staff for final approval. Second by Commissioner Garapolo. Motion approved 6-0.

AYE: Commissioner Carr, Commissioner Chase, Commissioner Garapolo, Commissioner Gurski, Commissioner Sokol, and Acting Chair Houze

NAY: None

- D. Advisory Review 233 N Ridgeland Ave (Gary and Dory Rodriguez):** Advisory Review for the construction of a new single-family residence on the vacant lot at 233 N Ridgeland Ave (Frank Lloyd Wright-Prairie School of Architecture Historic District).

Acting Chair Houze introduced the application. Planner Trexler gave an overview.

John Belcher, of JMB Architects, and Gary and Dory Rodriguez, the homeowners, were present. Mr. Belcher said the homeowners currently live in Oak Park and the lot in question is a corner, empty lot. He noted that architect Kirk Michaelson and Monsato Builders are in the audience.

Mr. Rodriguez said he and his family have lived in Oak Park since 2003 and are looking to build a house that will meet their needs. They wanted a house that both fits in with the character of the neighborhood and is updated.

Mr. Belcher explained some of the choices made in designing the house, including the porch on Ridgeland, which was important to the homeowners and reflects the neighborhood.

Motion by Commissioner Garapolo to open for discussion. Second by Commissioner Carr.

Acting Chair Houze said this will be Advisory Review so the Commission will not vote. She asked if the Commission has any comments.

Commissioner Carr said she appreciates that the house is raised 4.5 feet off the ground and likes the varied side elevation with the decorative chimney element. She recommended that the window mullions be adjusted to form vertical rectangles of glass rather than horizontal rectangles.

Commissioner Sokol said he appreciates the sensitivity to the historic district. Commissioner Carr added that the scale house is appropriate and there is more open space. Commissioner Garapolo recommended using wood siding rather than Hardie board.

Commissioner Gurski agreed with Commissioner Carr's comment regarding the windows and said he understands the maintenance aspect of the Hardie board.

Acting Chair Houze agreed that wood siding would be preferred. She noted the verticality of the nearby Victorian era houses as compared to the horizontal Prairie style. She said the proposed house suggests the Queen Anne style but the gable is not steep and asked why. Mr. Belcher said they were working with height restrictions but can revisit this.

The choice of vertical and horizontal siding was discussed, as well as the rhythm of the windows. Acting Chair Houze said the proposed house maintains the rhythm and proportions of the street, which is appropriate.

OTHER BUSINESS

Acting Chair Houze said the Historic Preservation Awards were presented the previous night and congratulated the winners. She introduced the new Commissioner, Monique Chase, and reminded the Commission that there are currently two open spots on the Commission.

ADJOURN

Motion by Commissioner Sokol to adjourn; Second by Commissioner Garapolo.

The meeting adjourned at 8:15PM.

Minutes prepared by Susie Trexler, Historic Preservation Urban Planner.