

**Oak Park Historic Preservation Commission**  
**June 13, 2019 - Meeting Minutes**  
**Oak Park Village Hall, Council Chambers, 7:30 pm**

**Roll Call**

Present: Chair Christopher Payne and Commissioners Tom Abrahamson, Jennifer Bridge, Sandra Carr, Lou Garapolo, Rebecca Houze, and Noel Weidner  
Absent: Commissioners Darrick Gurski, Laura Jordahl, Aleksandra Tadic and David Sokol  
Staff: Susie Trexler, Historic Preservation Urban Planner  
Attorney: Gregory Smith, Klein, Thorpe & Jenkins

**Agenda Approval**

Chair Payne said that at the request of the applicant, item G will be moved to the end of the agenda.

*Motion by Commissioner Weidner to approve the agenda with the proposed revision to move item G to the end of the agenda; Second by Commissioner Garapolo; Motion approved 7-0.*

**Minutes**

*Motion by Commissioner Abrahamson to approve draft minutes for May 9, 2019; Second by Commissioner Houze; Motion approved 7-0.*

**Regular Agenda**

- A. HPC2019-29: 1139 Randolph St (OPRF Nursery):** Certificate of Appropriateness for masonry and concrete repair on three sets of exterior stairs (Landmark in the Ridgeland-Oak Park Historic District).

Chair Payne introduced the application and Planner Trexler gave an overview.

Cari Christoff, the Executive Director of the Oak Park and River Forest Day Nursery, was present. She said that their intent is to preserve the historic integrity of the building.

*Motion by Commissioner Bridge to open for discussion; Second by Commissioner Houze.*

Commissioner Garapolo confirmed that the only bricks to be replaced are the damaged bricks. He expressed concern that this means the bricks may not match and asked if the applicant considered replacing all the bricks. Ms. Christoff said that the cost would dramatically increase if all the bricks were to be replaced.

Commissioners Garapolo and Weidner recommended cleaning and salvaging bricks where possible.

*Motion by Commissioner Carr to open for discussion; second by Commissioner Weidner.*

*Motion by Commissioner Carr to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness to repair the stairs as proposed. Second by Commissioner Weidner. Motion approved 7-0.*

*AYE: Commissioner Abrahamson, Commissioner Bridge, Commissioner Carr, Commissioner Garapolo, Commissioner Houze, Commissioner Weidner, and Chair Payne*

*NAY: None*

- B. HPC2019-18: 300 N East Ave (Karl and Karen Emanuel):** Certificate of Appropriateness update to alter the east dormer window roof and alter window types on previously approved new garage (Ridgeland-Oak Park Historic District).

Chair Payne introduced the application and Planner Trexler gave an overview.

Brett Williams, the contractor for the project, was present. Mr. Williams said the awning windows were requested by the client and the change in the east dormer is for structural and cost reasons. If it matches the gabled west dormer, it is easier to balance the building structurally.

*Motion by Commissioner Weidner to open for discussion; second by Commissioner Garapolo.*

Commissioner Garapolo asked Mr. Williams about the soffit and fascia fire rating and Mr. Williams explained that the garage is within three feet of the property line.

The Commission did not express any issues with the proposed changes.

*Motion by Commissioner Abrahamson to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness for the new garage. Second by Commissioner Carr. Motion approved 7-0.*

*AYE: Commissioner Abrahamson, Commissioner Bridge, Commissioner Carr, Commissioner Garapolo, Commissioner Houze, Commissioner Weidner, and Chair Payne*

*NAY: None*

- C. HPC2019-30: 611 N Elmwood Ave (Kate Goldhaber & Brian Wilhite):** Certificate of Appropriateness to demolish historic garage and build new garage (Frank Lloyd Wright-Prairie School of Architecture Historic District).

Chair Payne introduced the application and Planner Trexler gave an overview.

Debra McQueen, the architect, was present. Ms. McQueen said that the existing garage is deteriorated. It was built in 1901 and has an addition that has settled differently, causing additional issues. The new garage will have casement windows, which work with the house.

*Motion by Commissioner Weidner to open for discussion; second by Commissioner Garapolo.*

The Commission did not express any concerns with the project as proposed.

*Motion by Commissioner Weidner to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness to remove the existing garage and build a new garage. Second by Commissioner Houze. Motion approved 7-0.*

*AYE: Commissioner Abrahamson, Commissioner Bridge, Commissioner Carr, Commissioner Garapolo, Commissioner Houze, Commissioner Weidner, and Chair Payne*

*NAY: None*

- D. HPC2019-25: 426 S Austin Blvd (Jean Montgomery):** Certificate of Appropriateness for window replacement on front façade, resubmitted at the request of the HPC at May 9, 2019 meeting (Landmark, not in a historic district).

Chair Payne introduced the application and Planner Trexler gave an overview.

Jean Montgomery, the homeowner, and Robert Jackson, the Columbus Court Condo Association Treasurer, were present. Mr. Jackson said that they do not want to lose landmark status. They are concerned that changing the windows may affect their property taxes. He recommended that Ms. Montgomery be given a grandfather clause for her windows. He said if the Commission approves, the Condo Association approves.

*Motion by Commissioner Bridge to open for discussion; second by Commissioner Houze.*

Chair Payne said that landmark status would only change if someone came to the Historic Preservation Commission and requested it. A Certificate of Appropriateness does not affect landmark status.

Commissioner Abrahamson asked for the number of windows; window details were clarified.

Mr. Jackson said that if the windows match in color, they will look the same as the historic windows because they are located on the second floor.

The Commission discussed why the windows were removed, the pattern, the color, and the options. Commissioner Weidner said he thinks they should be wood but he supports the option supplied by Tayloe Glass if wood is not possible. Mr. Jackson said that Ms. Montgomery was replacing her windows for a reason and putting the original windows back will just delay the issue for a year. The Commission noted that storm windows would help but this would be an additional expense.

Commissioner Houze asked to what extent the rest of the condo building can be considered. Attorney Smith said that the task of the Commission is to apply the Guidelines to the application. A COA cannot have a condition that has to do with the condo association but the Commission can ask that the staff work with the association.

Mr. Jackson said that the Association should have been consulted first but that they are hoping at this point to resolve the issue.

Commissioners Garapolo, Bridge, and Houze said that repair of the original windows should be done if possible. The Guidelines prioritize repair over replacement. Commissioner Carr said that the applicant's selection is appropriate and the cost estimate for putting the original windows back does not appear to include restoration of the windows. Chair Payne agreed that the cost estimate for putting the windows back isn't complete and said he also supports the applicant's choice. The glass should be removed and the grid should be placed on the exterior.

Commissioners Weidner and Carr agreed that there may be missing hardware from the original windows and the cost to put back the original windows doesn't appear complete.

*Motion by Commissioner Houze to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness for replacement of the glass in the existing windows with the correct grid pattern on the exterior of the glass. Second by Commissioner Weidner. Motion approved 6-1.*

*AYE: Commissioner Abrahamson, Commissioner Bridge, Commissioner Carr, Commissioner Houze, Commissioner Weidner, and Chair Payne*

*NAY: Commissioner Garapolo*

- E. HPC2019-31: 409-411 Washington Blvd (409-411 Washington Blvd Condo Association):** Certificate of Appropriateness to replace slate roof with asphalt shingles (Ridgeland-Oak Park Historic District).

Chair Payne introduced the application and Planner Trexler gave an overview.

Marjans (Mike) Bartkovjaks, the roofing contractor, and Carolina Merchan, president of the condo board, were present.

Ms. Merchan explained that they originally intended to replace the slate roof with slate but when the work began, they found additional damage and the cost of the work became double the original.

*Motion by Commissioner Weidner to open for discussion; second by Commissioner Houze.*

Commissioner Weider said he does not think that Hardie board is appropriate for the sides of the dormer window. Commissioner Garapolo agreed and said he has no issue with the proposed Camelot shingle for the rest of the roof. Mr. Bartkovjaks said that the existing slate is completely deteriorated and the roof may not be able to withstand the weight of new slate shingles. Commissioner Abrahamson asked if slate can be kept on the dormer only. The Commission discussed alternative siding options that would be closer to slate. The Commission and applicants agreed that slate would be repaired or replaced on the sides of the dormer using slate from the existing roof.

*Motion by Commissioner Weidner to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness for the slate roof to be replaced with the proposed asphalt shingle with the condition that the slate on the sides of the dormer be repaired or replaced to match. Second by Commissioner Garapolo. Motion approved 7-0.*

*AYE: Commissioner Abrahamson, Commissioner Bridge, Commissioner Carr, Commissioner Garapolo, Commissioner Houze, Commissioner Weidner, and Chair Payne*

*NAY: None*

- F. HPC2019-32: 403 N Scoville Ave (Betsy and Jay Tharp):** Certificate of Appropriateness to modify the fenestration pattern on the second floor rear of the house (Frank Lloyd Wright-Prairie School of Architecture Historic District).

Chair Payne introduced the application and Planner Trexler gave an overview.

Jay Tharp, the homeowner, and Roseanne McGrath, the architect, were present.

Mr. Tharp said that they are creating a master bedroom and they are committed to maintaining the historic character of the house. Ms. McGrath said that the portion of the building being modified is likely not original and has been modified multiple times previously.

*Motion by Commissioner Garapolo to open for discussion; second by Commissioner Weidner.*

Commissioner Weidner said that he appreciates the architect providing sheet HP3 (showing previous alterations to the house). He said he has no objection to the project. Commissioner

Garapolo and Chair Payne agreed. Chair Payne noted that it will be partially visible but it is not a primary façade.

*Motion by Commissioner Carr to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness for the project to alter the fenestration pattern as proposed. Second by Commissioner Houze. Motion approved 6-1-0.*

*AYE: Commissioner Bridge, Commissioner Carr, Commissioner Garapolo, Commissioner Houze, Commissioner Weidner, and Chair Payne*

*Abstain: Commissioner Abrahamson*

*NAY: None*

(Note that item G was moved to the end of the agenda)

**H. HPC2019-34: 216 S Taylor Ave (Jim Balanza):** Certificate of Appropriateness for rear addition (Ridgeland-Oak Park Historic District).

Chair Payne introduced the application and Planner Trexler gave an overview. Planner Trexler recommended that, based on the Architectural Review Guidelines, the attic deck railing should be given details to match the front porch or should be moved inward so as not to be visible from the street.

Foster Chambers, the contractor, was present. He said that they owners are willing to take recommendations on the proposed attic deck.

*Motion by Commissioner Weidner to open for discussion; second by Commissioner Houze.*

Commissioner Garapolo said he supports the staff recommendations. Commissioner Weidner agreed. Chair Payne said he supports moving the railing so it is not visible and Commissioner Abrahamson said that this would solve the safety issue of roof access, as well. Mr. Chambers said that the railing can be moved as requested. No vote was required as, if the railing is moved, a Certificate of Appropriateness is not needed.

**I. HPC2019-35: 1118 Wenonah Ave (Ray Martinez):** Certificate of Appropriateness to remove existing front porch windows and create an open front porch (Gunderson Historic District).

Chair Payne introduced the application and Planner Trexler gave an overview.

The applicant was not in attendance.

*Motion by Commissioner Bridge to open for discussion; second by Commissioner Weidner.*

Commissioner Garapolo said the end result is unclear. The Commission asked if the stairs will be altered and if there will be new columns or railings. Commissioner Houze recommended that the project be reviewed by the Architectural Review Committee. Chair Payne requested additional details be provided from the applicant, including information about fall protection at the knee wall, hand rail termination, and if there will be any additional structural requirements. Commissioner Abrahamson recommended a rendering. Chair Payne agreed that a rendering or front elevation drawing should be submitted.

- J. HPC2019-36: 607 Forest Ave (Sead Navalic and Azra Omerovic):** Certificate of Appropriateness to alter roof shape on previously approved side addition (Frank Lloyd Wright-Prairie School of Architecture Historic District).

Chair Payne introduced the application and Planner Trexler gave an overview.

The applicant was not in attendance.

*Motion by Commissioner Carr to open for discussion; second by Commissioner Weidner.*

The Commission reviewed the elevation and determined that there was insufficient information supplied. They expressed concern about water drainage and requested that the applicant submit additional drawings. The item was tabled until constructability issues are resolved.

*Note: due to computer error, paper copies were needed for Commission review; the Commission proceeded with item K and returned to item J following the retrieval of paper copies.*

- K. HPC2019-37: 851 Columbian Ave (John Bosch):** Certificate of Appropriateness to add a basement level egress window on the south elevation (Frank Lloyd Wright-Prairie School of Architecture Historic District). The associated renovation and addition were previously approved by the HPC on February 14, 2019.

Chair Payne introduced the project.

John Bosch, the homeowner, was present. Mr. Bosch explained that the egress window had to be added to the basement so the plans were resubmitted. He said it is not visible the way the property sits. The front faces Columbian, the main entrance is on Division, and the new window will be on the opposite side from the entrance.

*Motion by Commissioner Abrahamson to open for discussion; second by Commissioner Garapolo.*

The Commission had no questions or comments.

*Motion by Commissioner Houze to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness to add a basement level egress window. Second by Commissioner Carr. Motion approved 7-0.*

*AYE: Commissioner Abrahamson, Commissioner Bridge, Commissioner Carr, Commissioner Garapolo, Commissioner Houze, Commissioner Weidner, and Chair Payne*

*NAY: None*

- L. HPC2019-38: 113 N Oak Park Ave (Gerpapa LLC):** Certificate of Appropriateness to remove existing plaster and temporary weather protection on east façade and install new precast concrete panels with lettering (Ridgeland-Oak Park Historic District).

The architect, William Gamble, and the building owner were present. The owner stated that he has owned the building since May 2018. They began tuckpointing but didn't know what was behind the plaster patch. It became apparent that the plaster conceals an I-beam that provides building support, allowing the large windows below. The I-beam is deteriorating from water damage. They plan to install a C-channel and cover with something like limestone to match existing details on the building.

*Motion by Commissioner Houze to open for discussion; second by Commissioner Garapolo.*

The Commission asked about the name and the owner clarified that this will be the name of the building. Mr. Gamble said that the letters will be carved into the stone. It was confirmed that the installation would not damage any historic masonry.

*Motion by Commissioner Abrahamson to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness for the project as proposed. Second by Commissioner Weidner. Motion approved 7-0.*

*AYE: Commissioner Abrahamson, Commissioner Bridge, Commissioner Carr, Commissioner Garapolo, Commissioner Houze, Commissioner Weidner, and Chair Payne*

*NAY: None*

- G. HPC2019-33: 417 N Ridgeland Ave (George Goehl):** Certificate of Appropriateness to remove and replace front porch with a porch that is two feet wider than existing (Frank Lloyd Wright-Prairie School of Architecture Historic District).

Chair Payne introduced the application and Planner Trexler gave an overview.

Ai Jen Poo, the homeowner, was present. She stated that they wish to improve their current porch.

*Motion by Commissioner Bridge to open for discussion; second by Commissioner Garapolo.*

The Commission discussed the use of round columns rather than square columns and decided that round would be appropriate due to the small size of the porch. Chair Payne said that eaves should be added to relate better to the house and the porch face and sides should include some detail and articulated corners. He suggested vertical slats of vertical beadboard. Commissioner Weidner agreed.

*Motion by Commissioner Weidner to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness for the porch replacement with the condition that an overhanging eave be added, the corners of the porch be articulated, and there be a different material on the face and sides of the porch. Motion approved 7-0.*

*AYE: Commissioner Abrahamson, Commissioner Bridge, Commissioner Carr, Commissioner Garapolo, Commissioner Houze, Commissioner Weidner, and Chair Payne*

*NAY: None*

- M. HPC2019-39: 810 N Ridgeland Ave (Christopher Payne):** Certificate of Appropriateness for rear addition and addition of bay window on the side elevation (Frank Lloyd Wright-Prairie School of Architecture Historic District).

Chair Payne stated he would step down from his position as Chair, as he is the applicant for 810 N Ridgeland Ave.

*Motion Commissioner Garapolo to designate Commissioner Weidner as temporary chair. Second by Commissioner Carr. Motion approved 6-0.*

Temporary Chair Weidner introduced the application and Planner Trexler gave an overview.

Christopher Payne, homeowner and architect, was present. Mr. Payne, explained the project, stating that the trim board is an existing trim board at the back of the house and they will salvage the kitchen window and put it in the proposed new bay.

*Motion by Commissioner Garapolo to open for discussion; second by Commissioner Carr.*

Commissioner Bridge said she appreciates the salvage of the trim and window. Commissioners Garapolo and Houze stated their agreement. Commissioner Houze said that the proposal is a good example of a bungalow modification.

*Motion by Commissioner Carr to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed bay window and rear addition as proposed. Second by Commissioner Houze. Motion approved 6-0.*

*AYE: Commissioner Abrahamson, Commissioner Bridge, Commissioner Carr, Commissioner Garapolo, Commissioner Houze, and Commissioner Weidner*

*NAY: None*

## **OTHER BUSINESS**

- N. 2019 Richard H. Driehaus Foundation Preservation Awards:** Nineteenth Century Club request for letter of recommendation. Category: preservation, subcategory: stewardship.

Chair Payne explained that the Nineteenth Century Club has requested a letter of recommendation for the Driehaus Awards. The Commission discussed the Driehaus Awards and the Nineteenth Century Club. It was agreed that the Nineteenth Century Club has done a good job with the restoration of their building.

*Motion by Commissioner Carr to request staff to forward a letter embodying the thoughts of the Commission. Second by Commissioner Houze. Motion Approved 7-0.*

*AYE: Commissioner Abrahamson, Commissioner Bridge, Commissioner Carr, Commissioner Garapolo, Commissioner Houze, Commissioner Weidner, and Chair Payne*

*NAY: None*

- O. HPC Realtor Education Event:** Discuss potential event aimed to provide realtors with more information on the historic preservation permit process.

Chair Payne introduced the idea focused on providing information to realtors on the historic preservation process in Oak Park. Attorney Smith said that at the event, three or more Commissioners cannot discuss at once. Chair Payne said informal discussions in small groups would be a good method.

Commissioner Carr said that there is a lot of misinformation and many people don't realize they live in historic districts and Commissioner Houze said many people mistakenly think it is hard to sell landmarks. Commissioner Carr said that realtors can also promote historic preservation tax credits. Commissioner Weidner said they should have workshops to prepare responses and a planning meeting. Attorney Smith said that to discuss the event, the Commission must include it on an agenda. Commissioner Abrahamson said that this type of outreach is what brought them to the Historic Preservation Commission. It was agreed that the Commission should aim to host this event in September and have additional events in the spring of 2020 if it goes well.

- P. Day in Our Village:** Chair Payne said the Historic Preservation Commission table at Day in Our Village had a lot of visitors and questions. It was common to have people who did not know they



lived in a historic district. He said that the Commission should have a map next year and also recommended a demonstration. Commissioner Carr agreed.

**ADJOURN**

*Motion by Commissioner Carr to adjourn. Second by Commissioner Garapolo.*

The meeting adjourned at 9:40PM.

Minutes prepared by Susie Trexler, Urban Planner Historic Preservation.